Examples of the Standards for Students’ Writing

English Language Arts 30–2

From the January 2010 Diploma Examination

- Visual Reflection Assignment
- Literary Exploration Assignment
- Persuasive Writing in Context Assignment
This document was written primarily for:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Role</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Students</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teachers</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Administrators</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parents</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General Public</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Copyright 2010, the Crown in Right of Alberta, as represented by the Minister of Education, Alberta Education, Learner Assessment, 44 Capital Boulevard, 10044 108 Street NW, Edmonton, Alberta T5J 5E6, and its licensors. All rights reserved.

Special permission is granted to Alberta educators only to reproduce, for educational purposes and on a non-profit basis, parts of this document that do not contain excerpted material.

Excerpted material in this document shall not be reproduced without the written permission of the original publisher (see credits, where applicable).
Contents

Acknowledgements ii

Introduction 1

English Language Arts 30–2 January 2010 Writing Assignments 3
  Assignment I: Visual Reflection 4
  Assignment II: Literary Exploration 6
  Assignment III: Persuasive Writing in Context 9

English Language Arts 30–2 Part A: Written Response Standards Confirmation 12
  Background 12
  Impressions of Standards Confirmers January 2010 13

Examples of Students’ Writing with Teachers’ Commentaries 15
  English Language Arts 30–2 Visual Reflection Assignment, January 2010 15
  English Language Arts 30–2 Literary Exploration Assignment, January 2010 26
  English Language Arts 30–2 Persuasive Writing in Context Assignment, January 2010 44

Scoring Categories and Criteria 56
Acknowledgements

Publication of this document would not have been possible without the permission of the students whose writing is presented. The cooperation of these students has allowed us to continue defining the standards of writing performance expected in connection with diploma examinations and demonstrating approaches taken by students in their writing.

This document includes the valuable contributions of many educators. Sincere thanks and appreciation are extended to the following Standards Confirmers: Brianna Storey, Chris Llewellyn, Claudia Haney, Lynn Hemming, Kjirsten Wilson, Margaret Lewis, Richard Wagner, and Ryan Cancilla.

We gratefully acknowledge the contributions made by members of the Humanities Unit and the Document Design and Desktop Publishing Unit of Learner Assessment, Alberta Education.

You can reach us with your comments and questions by e-mail to Philip.Taranger@gov.ab.ca, Keri.Helgren@gov.ab.ca, or Tim.Coates@gov.ab.ca, or by regular mail at

Alberta Education
Box 43
44 Capital Boulevard
10044 108 Street NW
Edmonton, Alberta T5J 5E6

We would be pleased to hear from you.
Introduction

The written responses in this document are examples of English Language Arts 30–2 Diploma Examination writing that received scores of Satisfactory (S), Proficient (Pf), or Excellent (E). These sample responses are taken from the January 2010 administration. Along with the commentaries that accompany them, they should help you and your students to understand the standards for English Language Arts 30–2 Diploma Examination writing in relation to the scoring criteria.

The purpose of the sample responses is to illustrate the standards that governed the January 2010 marking session and that anchor the selection of similar sample responses for subsequent marking sessions in 2010 and 2011. The sample papers and the commentaries were used to train markers to apply the scoring criteria consistently and to justify their decisions about scores in terms of each student’s work and the criteria.

The sample responses included in this document represent a very small sample of successful approaches to the assignments.

Selection and Use of Sample Papers

The teachers on the Standards Confirmation Committee for the January 2010 marking session selected the examples of student responses included here. They also wrote the commentaries that discuss the students’ writing in terms of the scoring criteria used for marking.

During their preparation for the January 2010 marking session, markers reviewed and validated the standards represented by these sample responses. Markers then used these sample responses as guidelines for marking the written-response sections of the January 2010 English Language Arts 30–2 Diploma Examination.

Cautions

1. The commentaries are brief.

The commentaries were written for groups of markers to discuss and apply during the marking session. Although brief, they provide a model for relating specific examples from student work to the details in a specific scoring criterion.

2. Neither the scoring guide nor the assignments are meant to limit students to a single organizational or rhetorical approach in completing any diploma examination assignment.

Students must be free to select and organize their materials in a manner that they feel will enable them to best present their ideas. In fact, part of what is being assessed is the final effectiveness of the content, the form and structure, and the rhetorical choices that students make.
The student writing in this document illustrates just a few of the many successful organizational and rhetorical strategies in January 2010.

We strongly recommend that you caution your students that there is no preferred approach to an assignment except the approach that best accomplishes the student writer’s goal of effectively communicating his or her own ideas about the topic.

We advise you not to draw any conclusions about common patterns of approach taken by students.

3. The sample papers presented in this document must not be used as models for instructional purposes.

Because these papers are illustrations only, and because they are sample responses to a set topic, students must be cautioned not to memorize the content of any of these assignments and not to use them when completing classroom assignments or when writing future diploma examinations. Examination markers and staff at Alberta Education take any possibility of plagiarism or cheating seriously. The consequences for students are grave.

The approaches taken by students at the standard of excellence, not their words or ideas, are what students should consider emulating. In fact, it is hoped that the variety of approaches presented here will inspire students to experiment with diction, syntax, and form and structure as ways of developing an individual voice and engaging the reader in ideas and forms that the student has considered.

4. It is essential that you consider each of these examples of student writing in light of the constraints of the examination situation.

Under examination conditions, students produce first-draft writing. Given more time, students would be expected to produce papers of considerably improved quality, particularly in the dimensions of Presentation, Matters of Correctness, and Writing Skills.
January 2010  
English Language Arts 30–2  
Part A: Written Response  
Grade 12 Diploma Examination

Description

Time: 2½ hours. This examination was developed to be completed in 2½ hours; however, you may take an additional ½ hour to complete the examination.

Plan your time carefully.

Part A: Written Response contributes 50% of the total English Language Arts 30–2 Diploma Examination mark and consists of three assignments.

• Assignment I:  
  Visual Reflection  
  Value 10% of total examination mark

• Assignment II:  
  Literary Exploration  
  Value 25% of total examination mark

• Assignment III:  
  Persuasive Writing in Context  
  Value 15% of total examination mark

Instructions

• Complete all three assignments.

• You may use the following print references:  
  – an English and/or bilingual dictionary  
  – a thesaurus  
  – an authorized writing handbook

• Space is provided in this booklet for planning and for your written work.

• Use blue or black ink for your written work.

Additional Instructions for Students Using Word Processors

• Format your work using an easy-to-read 12-point or larger font such as Times.

• Double-space your final copy.

• Staple your final printed work to the pages indicated for word-processed work for each assignment. Hand in all work.

• Indicate in the space provided on the back cover that you have attached word-processed pages.

Do not write your name anywhere in this booklet. Feel free to make corrections and revisions directly on your written work.
ASSIGNMENT I: VISUAL REFLECTION
Suggested time: 30 to 40 minutes

The following photographs depict the same location in the Canadian Rockies. The first was taken in the late 19th century, the second one in the late 20th century.
ASSIGNMENT I: VISUAL REFLECTION

Examine the photographs on page 4. Reflect upon the ideas and impressions suggested by the photographs.

The Assignment

What ideas and impressions do the photographs suggest to you? Consider the context, and develop your response by referring to the photographs.

In your writing, you may respond personally, critically, and/or creatively.

You must

• select a prose form that is appropriate to the ideas you wish to express and that will enable you to effectively communicate to the reader
• consider how you can create a strong unifying effect

Initial Planning
ASSIGNMENT II: LITERARY EXPLORATION
Suggested time: 70 to 80 minutes

Read the following nonfiction excerpt and complete the assignment that follows.

During the Second World War, British and American ships carried desperately needed provisions through the dangerous waters of the Arctic Sea from Scotland to Murmansk. This excerpt describes the conditions these convoys faced on the voyage to Russia.

from H.M.S. ULYSSES

It had been building up, steadily, inexorably, all during the morning. Now, at noon, it looked uncommonly like an eighteenth-century print of a bark in a storm—serried waves of greenish-grey, straight, regular and marching uniformly along, each decoratively topped with frothing caps of white. Only here, there were five hundred feet between crest and crest, and the squadron, heading almost directly into it, was taking hearty punishment.

For the little ships, already burying their bows every fifteen seconds in a creaming smother of cascading white, this was bad enough, but another, a more dangerous and insidious enemy was at work—the cold. The temperature had long sunk below the freezing point, and the mercury was still shrinking down, close towards the zero mark.

The cold was now intense: ice formed in cabins and mess-decks; fresh-water systems froze solid; metal contracted; hatch-covers jammed; door hinges locked in frozen immobility; the oil in the searchlight controls gummed up and made them useless. To keep a watch, especially a watch on the bridge, was torture: the first shock of that bitter wind seared the lungs, left a man fighting for breath; if he had forgotten to don gloves—first the silk gloves then the woolen mittens, then the sheepskin gauntlets—and touched a handrail, the palms of the hands seared off, the skin burned as by white-hot metal. On the bridge, if he forgot to duck when the bows smashed down into a trough, the flying spray, solidified in a second into hurtling slivers of ice, lanced cheek and forehead open to the bone. Hands froze, the very marrow of the bones numbed, the deadly chill crept upwards from feet to calves to thighs, nose and chin turned white with frostbite and demanded immediate attention; and then, by far the worst of all, the return below deck, the writhing, excruciating agony of returning circulation. But, for all this, words are useless things, pale shadows of reality. Some things lie beyond the knowledge and the experience of the majority of mankind, and here imagination finds itself in a world unknown.

Alistair Maclean

1 bark—sailing ship

The Assignment

In this excerpt, the author describes a situation that exists outside the experience of most people. In such a situation, even an individual’s ability to imagine potential dangers may be overwhelmed.

What is your opinion of the idea that the dangers we face may lie beyond our understanding?

You must

• discuss a character from literature or film that you have studied in English Language Arts 30–2. You may choose to discuss more than one character

• ensure the details you select support your opinion of the idea that the dangers we face may lie beyond our understanding

• present your ideas in prose

You should

• reflect upon your own knowledge and/or experience and/or the reading selection provided

• use the Personal Reflection on Choice of Character(s) from Literary Text(s) (see page 8) to help you select a character who is relevant to this assignment and interesting to you from the short stories, novels, plays, poetry, nonfiction, or films that you have studied in English Language Arts 30–2

• carefully consider your controlling idea or how you will create a strong unifying effect in your response. Organize your discussion so that your ideas are clearly and effectively presented
Assignment II: Literary Exploration

Initial Planning

Please use this space for your initial planning. This information assists markers in identifying the text(s) and character(s) you have chosen. The markers who read your composition will be very familiar with the literary texts you have chosen.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Literary Text(s)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Author(s)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Character(s)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Personal Reflection on Choice of Character(s) from Literary Text(s)

Suggested time: 10 minutes

Briefly explain why you chose this character to develop your opinion of the idea that the dangers we face may lie beyond our understanding. Markers will consider the information you provide here when determining the effectiveness of your response.
ASSIGNMENT III: PERSUASIVE WRITING IN CONTEXT
Suggested time: 40 to 50 minutes

Read the situation described below and use it to complete the assignment that follows.

The Situation

Virtuosity, a leading-edge technology designer, has developed a complete three dimensional virtual reality system suitable for use by individuals or groups in educational or leisure settings. The system would enable people to participate interactively in a wide variety of historical and geographical settings.

To advertise its system, Virtuosity held a lottery open to all high schools across North America. Prosper was one of 10 winning schools that will receive the complete system and all logistical and technical support for a period of one year. During this time, Virtuosity will use the school environment to refine the technology and create the software for additional scenarios. The Prosper School Board would like to accept the offer, but acknowledges that the consequences to staff, students, and community would be considerable. The decision must be made in one month, and in light of this, they have invited Prosper residents to make their views known.

You are Kerry Huxley, a recent graduate of Prosper High School. After considering the advantages and disadvantages of the proposal (see pages 10 and 11), you have reached a decision. You now need to write a persuasive speech or letter that clearly explains

• your decision on whether the school board should accept the offer
• the reasons why you believe your decision to be the best decision

The Assignment

Write a speech or letter that will persuade the Prosper School Board either to ACCEPT or to REJECT the offer of the Virtuosity system.

In preparing your persuasive speech or letter, BE SURE TO

• consider your purpose and audience
• study the information on the following pages
• use an appropriate tone

Remember that you must clearly and directly choose either to accept or to reject the proposal to Prosper School Board.
What is the Virtuosity Interactive System?

The Virtuosity Interactive System is a cutting-edge virtual reality simulator that enables small or large groups to participate interactively in any setting that can be imagined. Its developers claim that the experience is so realistic that it’s the same as actually being there. Current programs include a First World War battlefield, the voyage of the Titanic, an ascent of Mount Everest, and the first performance of Shakespeare’s Macbeth at the Globe Theatre. Development of additional scenarios, including virtual chemistry and biology laboratories, is ongoing.

Statement from the Prosper School Board

It was a tremendous stroke of luck to be one of the winners of such a large competition. It would be impossible for a school the size of Prosper to be able to purchase such an expensive and complex system, and we feel that the year-long trial will be a remarkable time of learning for the students and teachers of Prosper High School. In addition to the educational value of the scenarios themselves, there is also the chance to participate in the development of a truly revolutionary educational tool. The Prosper School Board has always stood behind its commitment to make the best educational resources available to its students and teachers.

Statement from the Citizen Action Committee

Virtuosity is basically using schools as the test bed for developing its hardware and software. How much time will be lost due to technical glitches, troubleshooting, debugging, and revising expectations? This will be a massive disruption to the educational environment, and it will affect everyone. When the year is up, what happens then? Virtuosity has said that it will make the systems available to the trial schools at a reduced cost, but the company has been vague on what that cost might be. There’s also no guarantee that the system will even work as advertised. We’re asking students and teachers at Prosper High School to assume a tremendous risk in committing to instruct this way based on promises that may not be fulfilled.
Opinions on the Proposed System

Education has always moved hand-in-hand with technological advances. Is there any teacher out there who would prefer to teach prior to the availability of film, computers, or electronic resources? We risk being left behind in a highly competitive world if we’re not willing to see beyond current educational practice. And is there anyone who thinks two hours spent discussing Martin Luther King Jr.’s “I Have a Dream” speech in the classroom is the same as five minutes spent at the foot of the Lincoln Memorial? Can you imagine standing there listening to those historic words and watching the crowd’s reaction first hand?

Ron Fong, Prosper lawyer

We already have an interactive device capable of transporting individuals to other places and periods; it’s called a book. Educators seem to be particularly prone to embracing trends, as if they will solve all their problems. Can there be any substitute to being able to read deeply and well? Teachers should spend their energies on providing students with the literacy skills and tools that will enable them to become independent lifelong learners. There is no substitute for the informed human imagination. We already have that software.

Sarah Bendale, parent

The educational horizons this technology opens up are truly awe inspiring. I want to stand on the moon and watch the earth rise above its horizon like the Apollo astronauts did. I want to meet the brave men and women who perished on the Titanic. I want to be able to meet Mozart and Beethoven, and talk politics with Winston Churchill. My imagination takes me only so far, and I want to live those experiences as though I were there. No other form of education promises such wealth.

Carla Seldana, student

Any software is only as good as its designer. A virtual trip to the top of Mount Everest is one thing. But the ability to accurately recreate any historical period is a task that challenges the most skilled of scholars. Has Virtuosity really put the same effort into the historical and cultural research that will be required to create these scenarios as it has into developing the tech and the hardware? And has anyone given any thought to the psychological risks associated with long-term immersion in what is essentially a high-end video game?

Manuel Sanchez, teacher
Background

For all diploma examination scoring sessions, Learner Assessment staff use a process called Standards Confirmation to establish and illustrate expectations for students’ work in relation to the scoring criteria, as well as to ensure scoring consistency within and between marking sessions. Because there are several diploma examination administrations and scoring sessions each school year, the standards must remain consistent for each scoring session in the school year and, similarly, from year to year.

Standards for student achievement start with the demands of the Program of Studies for Senior High School English Language Arts and with the interpretation of those demands through learning resources and classroom instruction. These agreed-upon standards are also exemplified in the kinds of tasks and the degree of independence expected of students. All of these complex applications of standards precede the design, development, and scoring of each diploma examination.

The Standards Confirmation Committee is composed of experienced teachers from representative regions of the province. These teachers work with the Learner Assessment staff responsible for the development, scoring, and results reporting for each diploma examination. Teacher-members participate over a two-year period and are required to serve as group leaders or markers during at least one of the subsequent marking sessions.

There are two essential parts to applying standards at the point of examination scoring: the expectations embedded in the scoring criteria and the examples of students’ work that illustrate the scoring criteria within each scoring category. The scoring categories and scoring criteria are available to teachers and students via the 2009–2010 English Language Arts 30–2 Information Bulletin. During each of the January and June marking sessions, example papers selected by members of the Standards Confirmation Committee are used to train markers. Subsequent to each marking session, the example papers that received scores of Satisfactory (S), Proficient (Pf), and Excellent (E) are posted on the Alberta Education website at education.alberta.ca in the documents entitled Examples of the Standards for Students’ Writing.

Members of the Standards Confirmation Committee

• confirm the appropriateness of the standards set by the examination in relation to students’ work
• select student responses that clearly illustrate the standards in the scoring categories and the scoring criteria to be used when training markers
• write rationales that explain and support the selection of sample papers in terms of the scoring categories, scoring criteria, and students’ work
Impressions of Standards Confirmers
January 2010

Assignment I: Visual Reflection
The contrast between the paired photographs, taken a century apart in the Canadian Rockies, provided a clear starting point for student reflections. Students discussed the contrast between traditional and modern views on the use of land, that life changes significantly over time, that the things we take for granted can disappear quickly, and that contemporary values reflect the desire to use the beauty of nature primarily for recreation. Students also drew conclusions from the photograph that led to discussions of the contemporary reality of First Nations peoples, the disappearance of traditional ways of life, and the fragility of nature. Many students developed “global” ideas that often addressed consumerism as well as political issues such as land claims, while others discussed the influence of technology on human progress. As always, students’ understanding of particular issues will vary, and students may make statements that are oversimplified or incorrect. Such assumptions and statements do not affect the quality of the responses. Markers also noted that the number of creative narrative responses continues to increase, as does the length of the responses. The creative forms most commonly chosen by students included first-person narratives, letters, and diary and journal entries.

Assignment II: Literary Exploration
The reading selection from H.M.S. Ulysses and the topic that the dangers we face may lie beyond our understanding was effectively engaging to student writers. Students shaped the topic in a variety of ways. Some focused primarily on the ways that various individuals and characters from literature face danger, while others based their responses on ideas such as encountering the unexpected and its various consequences. Students discussed their ideas on the topic in relation to personal observations, their own experiences, and literature and film studied in ELA 30–2. Unifying effects were varied: some students chose to focus primarily on literature, while others developed responses that focused on a variety of dangers and their attendant consequences. Students often chose to discuss more than one piece of literature, sometimes comparing the varied reactions of different characters and sometimes discussing each text separately. The nature of this assignment also elicited a wide variety of personal experiences that were related effectively to the topic. The focus of this assignment is on the idea that the student develops in relation to the topic and on how effectively the student explores and supports this idea. Thus, while the literary example is essential, it is but one component of the response as a whole. Because literary examples are sometimes brief and tightly focused on a particular situation or character, markers are reminded to read the information provided by students in the Personal Reflection on Choice of Character(s) from Literary Text(s), and to ensure that they are familiar with the literature or films chosen. Popular literary selections included Fallen Angels, Night, A Streetcar Named Desire, The Kite Runner, and The Alchemist. Students also used films such as The Shawshank Redemption, Life is Beautiful, Shackleton, and Castaway.
Assignment III: Persuasive Writing in Context

The proposal on whether or not to accept the Virtuosity system produced strong reactions from student writers. Students who supported the proposal cited the numerous educational benefits that would accrue from such immersive and interactive technology. They noted the tremendous opportunity afforded for the intimate experience of history, the appeal of moving beyond the traditional classroom experience, and the necessity to keep pace with technological advances in education. Students who rejected the proposal cited the unpredictable costs of experimental technology, not wanting to be treated as test subjects for a company, and the disruption that such an experimental system would have on school life, frequently remarking on the grand claims made by the developer and the risk of losing the appreciation for books and traditional learning. Students drew key details from the source material and often supplemented their arguments with references to their own personal observations, experiences, and knowledge. Some students also chose to acknowledge and refute positions from the opposing side. Most students were well aware of their purpose in persuading the Prosper School Board and maintained an appropriate tone. It is also important to note that students now have choice to write either a speech or a letter.
Examples of Students’ Writing with Teachers’ Commentaries

English Language Arts 30–2
Visual Reflection Assignment, January 2010
Example Scored Satisfactory (S)

In the first photograph it is a black and white picture showing a location in the Canadian Rocky Mountains, you can also see horses and teepees. In the second picture it is the same location but taken at a different time period and is in colour. The second photo shows a golf course with two golf players and a golf cart, you can see the mountains in the background more clearly than in photograph one.

The first photograph suggests that during the 19th century there were many settlements or tribes in the Canadian Rockies. As time went on and European settlers started coming and exploring the west more and more land was lost. The second photograph suggests that during the 20th century most of the land was taken over and in this part of the Rockies was made into a golf course. Over time things change, nothing will stay the same forever. These photographs are perfect examples. During the 19th century most of the Rockies were remote and very hard to reach certain places but as time progressed the technology became better and with that people were able to develop the land to make this golf course and roads.

Another idea that the photographs suggest is that over time the land has changed not naturally but by humans. Fewer trees can be seen in photograph two because of the making of the golf course and roads. They would have probably cut them down to make room.

Both Photographs suggest overtime and with advances in technology most of the natural land is destroyed to make recreational places such as gold courses and or roads.
#English Language Arts 30–2 January 2010
##Assignment I: Visual Reflection

###EXAMPLE PAPER—Satisfactory (S)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SCORING CRITERIA</th>
<th>RATIONALE</th>
<th>SCORE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Ideas and Impressions (S)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The student’s perceptions are appropriate but may be generalized.</td>
<td>The student’s perceptions that “Over time things change, nothing will stay the same forever” and “over time the land has changed not naturally but by humans” are appropriate but generalized.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Support is adequate and generally connected to the student’s ideas and impressions.</td>
<td>Support is adequate and generally connected to the student’s ideas: “During the 19th century most of the Rockies were remote and very hard to reach certain places but as time progressed the technology became better and with that people were able to develop the land to make this golf course and roads” and “Fewer trees can be seen in photograph two because of the making of the golf course and roads.”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Presentation (S)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The student’s voice is matter-of-fact and the tone is appropriate.</td>
<td>The student’s voice is matter-of-fact in statements such as “In the second picture it is the same location but taken at a different time period and is in colour.” The tone is appropriate.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Stylistic choices are adequate and occasionally effective.</td>
<td>Stylistic choices are adequate (“you can see the mountains in the background more clearly than in photograph one”) and occasionally effective (“As time went on and European settlers started coming and exploring the west more and more land was lost”).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The writing is generally clearly developed, and the unifying effect is appropriately sustained.</td>
<td>The writing is generally clearly developed from the initial observation of the differences between the two photographs, through the description of how man changes the land, to the conclusion that “over time and with advances in technology most of the natural land is destroyed to make recreational places such as gold courses and or roads.” The unifying effect is appropriately sustained.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Initial Planning

Photograph 1: Wildlife, Trees, Nature has a feeling of life to it

Photograph 2: Golf course, vehicles, people. The idea of people destroying beautiful land.
Assignment I: Visual Reflection

The ideas and impressions expressed through these two pictures can be taken into many different perspectives. One picture is over a hundred years old, while the other is only a decade ago.

From the perspective of a professional golfer, one would say that the newer photo of the golf course is very pleasing and satisfying. The lush green grass and the golden sand under a bright sky highlighted by the baby blue mountains covered in snow. Many would say that this picture is a picture of peace, because of the beautiful scenery surrounding the relaxing sport taking place; however, many would also beg to differ.

From a viewpoint of a humanitarian, the older photo would be more appealing. The picture has six beautiful horses outside a small camp, most likely occupied by first nations, and the trees around them are much denser than in the newer photo. This photo gives the idea of a peaceful land as well, but by using nature rather than entertainment. The mountains, the trees, and the land have a quiet feel to it. This however changes when you look at both of them in comparison.

When I first looked at the two pictures and realized that they were the same place, only a hundred years apart, the one word that came to my mind was destruction. Now that the land has been converted into a golf course, horses will not be seen there again. The trees will not be replaced, and the quiet feeling seems to just vanish. The destruction of the land destroyed the wildlife that inhabited it. Now it is just a place for people to entertain themselves and relax themselves.

The ideas and impressions that this photo showed me are that people destroy peaceful land to recreate it to their own selfish liking. It’s selfish destruction.
### EXAMPLE PAPER—Proficient (Pf)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SCORING CRITERIA</th>
<th>RATIONALE</th>
<th>SCORE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ideas and Impressions (Pf)</td>
<td>The student’s perception that while a golfer may like the first photo, those more concerned with the environment will find the second photo preferable because “people destroy peaceful land to recreate it to their own selfish liking” is thoughtful and considered.</td>
<td>Pf</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Support is relevant, detailed, and clearly connected to the student’s ideas and impressions.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Support is relevant, as in “this picture is a picture of peace, because of the beautiful scenery surrounding the relaxing sport taking place,” “the trees will not be replaced, and the quiet feeling seems to just vanish,” and “Now it is just a place for people to entertain themselves and relax themselves”; detailed, as in “highlighted by the baby blue mountains covered in snow,” “This photo gives the idea of a peaceful land as well, but by using nature rather than entertainment,” and “Now that the land has been converted into a golf course, horses will not be seen there again”; and clearly connected to the student’s ideas and impressions.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCORING CRITERIA</td>
<td>RATIONALE</td>
<td>SCORE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Presentation (Pf)</td>
<td>• The student’s voice is distinct and the tone is well considered. &lt;br&gt; • Stylistic choices are specific and frequently effective. &lt;br&gt; • The writing is coherently developed, and the unifying effect is capably sustained.</td>
<td>The student’s <strong>voice</strong> is distinct (“however, many would also beg to differ” and “the quiet feeling seems to just vanish”) and the <strong>tone</strong> is well considered (“the one word that came to my mind was destruction” and “the trees will not be replaced”). &lt;br&gt; <strong>Stylistic choices</strong> are specific and frequently effective: “The lush green grass and the golden sand under a bright sky,” “the land has been converted,” and “The destruction of the land destroyed the wildlife that inhabited it.” &lt;br&gt; The <strong>writing</strong> is coherently developed, and the <strong>unifying effect</strong> is capably sustained from the initial recognition that “the newer photo of the golf course is very pleasing and satisfying,” through the exploration of why “the older photo would be more appealing,” to the recognition that “people destroy peaceful land to recreate it to their own selfish liking.”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Initial Planning

The world has gone through many changes in a short time.
Assignment 1: Visual Reflection

Changes

Our world has gone through many changes in a short period of time. In only a time frame of one century, the very ground we stand on has shaped itself dramatically into something more beautiful than it was one hundred years ago. It has matured. Because of the golf course in the second picture. I personally think that we as humans have forgotten about the natural beautiful of this place we call home.

People in the 19th century, in a setting shown in the first photograph, lived and adjusted to the world instead of changing it to better fit them. They respected the earth and learned from it. It's what they lived for. By building a golf course in the middle of the Canadian Rockies we may think that we are allowing people to come and enjoy the beauty of life. But really, we're just playing golf. We dig up the earth for our own leisure. In my opinion, this is something that I would be completely against. In the process of building this golf course we probably killed a lot of animals, their homes, and wildlife. The earth itself breathes, it's alive. We have also cut down many trees. So by doing this, we're not only killing the earth, we're killing ourselves.

I think that we take our home completely and utterly for granted. We're too caught up in ourselves and building golf courses that will make us money that we never have the time to truly appreciate the things we have. The earth is a beautiful place but we fail to realize it. Things will only get worse. A part of me wishes that we could go back a century, to when everything was good and pure. We could learn from that. But a part of me knows that we will eventually learn from these two photographs right here. We will eventually run into that wall we have built and that's when we'll understand that this is
all we have. Some of us have already realized it and are doing all they can to preserve the
earth. The people who are “Going Green” and protesting against destroying wildlife will
be the people who save us. We only have one world, one life, one chance. Why not focus
on the things that really matter?
# EXAMPLE PAPER—Excellent (E)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SCORING CRITERIA</th>
<th>RATIONALE</th>
<th>SCORE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Ideas and Impressions (E)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The student’s perceptions are insightful and carefully considered.</td>
<td>The student’s perception (“We’re too caught up in ourselves and building golf courses that will make us money that we never have the time to truly appreciate the things we have. The earth is a beautiful place but we fail to realize it”) is insightful and carefully considered.</td>
<td>E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Support is precise, purposefully chosen, and strongly connected to the student’s ideas and impressions.</td>
<td>Support is precise, purposefully chosen, and strongly connected to the student’s ideas, as in “By building a golf course in the middle of the Canadian Rockies we may think that we are allowing people to come and enjoy the beauty of life, but really, we’re just playing golf,” “In the process of building this golf course we probably killed a lot of animals, their homes, and wildlife,” and “So by doing this, we’re not only killing the earth, we’re killing ourselves.”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCORING CRITERIA</td>
<td>RATIONALE</td>
<td>SCORE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Presentation (E)</strong></td>
<td>The student’s voice is <strong>engaging</strong> and the tone is confident.</td>
<td>E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The student’s voice is engaging and the tone is confident.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Stylistic choices are precise and effective.</td>
<td><strong>Stylistic choices</strong>—“the very ground we stand on,” “They respected the earth and learned from it. It’s what they lived for,” and “We only have one world, one life, one chance”—are <strong>precise and effective.</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The writing is skilfully developed, and the unifying effect is confidently sustained.</td>
<td>The writing is <strong>skillfully developed</strong>, and the <strong>unifying effect</strong> is <strong>confidently sustained</strong> from the student’s opening observation that “Our world has gone through many changes in a short period of time”; to the comparison of people living in the 19th century, who “lived and adjusted to the world,” with those living in the modern world, who “take our home completely and utterly for granted”; to a request that we all work together “to preserve the earth.”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

"The student’s voice is engaging and the tone is confident in statements such as “We dig up the earth for our own leisure,” “A part of me wishes that we could go back a century, to when everything was good and pure. We could learn from that,” and “Why not focus on the things that really matter?”

**Stylistic choices**—“the very ground we stand on,” “They respected the earth and learned from it. It’s what they lived for,” and “We only have one world, one life, one chance”—are **precise and effective.**

The writing is **skillfully developed**, and the **unifying effect** is **confidently sustained** from the student’s opening observation that “Our world has gone through many changes in a short period of time”; to the comparison of people living in the 19th century, who “lived and adjusted to the world,” with those living in the modern world, who “take our home completely and utterly for granted”; to a request that we all work together “to preserve the earth.”"
I chose the character Chris McCandless because he faced a number of challenges throughout his journey to Alaska. Their was danger for Chris which he didn’t know about and that cost him his life.
I think the dangers that we face in our life are for us to understand and make something better from it. Some times we may not think of the dangers that lie along the road ahead of us. The danger we may some times expect, doesn't always happened, yet something else we hadn't expected happens, something that might be life threatening or put you in serious danger.

Throughout the English year we read a lot, one novel that we came across which I thought fit perfectly for describing danger he faces was the book called "Into the Wild", by John Krauker. Chris McCandless was a smart young man with a great education. He liked to do his own thing. One day he left for a journey to Alaska burned his money and belongings expect his car, which he later ditched. Their was danger for him the day he left, he knew his journey wouldn't be easy, along the road a few months down, food was getting harder to find. So finally getting tired of looking for animals, he looked for a plant, and then later realized it was poisonous. It was danger he didn’t quite expect to happen.

An experience I’ve had that could relate to this would be when I got into my first car accident; I didn’t know that something like that would happen. It was danger that I didn’t get a warning for or a feeling. It was definitely danger that I did not understand.

I think the dangers that we face, we might not always know what’s going to happen, and that's why I think it becomes beyond our understanding.
## EXAMPLE PAPER—Satisfactory (S)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SCORING CRITERIA</th>
<th>RATIONALE</th>
<th>SCORE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Thought and Support (S)</td>
<td>A defensible understanding of the topic is demonstrated.</td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The student’s ideas are appropriately and straightforwardly explored.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The literary example is related adequately to the student’s ideas.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Support is relevant but tends to be general.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A defensible understanding of the topic is demonstrated through the discussion of the idea that “Some times we may not think of the dangers that lie along the road ahead of us.”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The student’s ideas are appropriately and straightforwardly explored through the discussions of how Chris was not expecting the dangers he encountered in the text <em>Into the Wild</em> and the student’s personal experience (“An experience I’ve had that could relate to this would be when I got into my first car accident; I didn’t know that something like that would happen”).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The literary example is related adequately to the student’s ideas in “It was danger he didn’t quite expect to happen.”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Support—“food was getting harder to find,” “he looked for a plant, and then later realized it was poisonous,” and “It was danger that I didn’t get a warning for or a feeling”—is relevant but tends to be general.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCORING CRITERIA</td>
<td>RATIONALE</td>
<td>SCORE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **Form and Structure (S)**       | **A controlling idea is evident** through the student’s discussion of the dangers that were unexpected or misunderstood but **unity falters** in the first paragraph about *Into the Wild*.  
**Development** of ideas and explanations is **generally clear and coherent** through the discussion that neither Chris nor the student expected the dangers encountered.  
The response moves to a **functional closure**: “I think the dangers that we face, we might not always know what’s going to happen, and that’s why I think it becomes beyond our understanding.” | S     |
| **Matters of Choice (S)**        | **Diction** is **appropriate** but **general** in statements such as “He liked to do his own thing” and “Throughout the English year we read a lot.”  
**Sentence structures** are **generally straightforward and clear**: “Chris McCandless was a smart young man with a great education” and “It was definitely danger that I did not understand.”  
**Stylistic choices** contribute to the creation of a **clear voice**.                                                                                                                                 | S     |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SCORING CRITERIA</th>
<th>RATIONALE</th>
<th>SCORE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Matters of Correctness (S)</td>
<td>This <strong>writing</strong> demonstrates <strong>control of the basics</strong> of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar and mechanics, as in “An experience I’ve had that could relate to this would be when I got into my first car accident; I didn’t know that something like that would happen.”</td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>There are <strong>occasional lapses</strong> in control of sentence construction and usage, and/or minor errors in grammar and mechanics.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The <strong>communication</strong>, however, is clear.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In life there are dangers that we face that may lie beyond our understanding. Many people go into situations that could be potentially dangerous, but may not fully understand how bad it is. Much like a house fire if someone is trapped some brave soul may try to save them putting their own life at risk not understanding the possible outcome. As demonstrated by the short excerpt *H.M.S. ULYSSES* by Alistair Maclean. The sailors during World War two faced dangers beyond what they expected. Also in the film *A Beautiful Mind* by Ron Howard we see a John Nash become a dangerous man and unpredictable. In personal response to the topic there have been instances where the danger of something was beyond my understanding. There are dangers that are faced that may be beyond our understanding.

In the excerpt *H.M.S. ULYSSES* by Alistair Maclean it is described the journey that the sailors during World War two had to face. With the most of the sailors thinking that enemy ships would be the biggest danger they probably did not think much about the elements. The story described how the blistering cold and freezing water took a toll on the men. Without experience it was a real danger to the men, but even with the ability of some people to imagine these potential dangers, they can be overwhelmed. Based on this story it is demonstrated how these men were about to face dangers, but not realize the ones beyond our understanding.

In the film *A Beautiful Mind* by Ron Howard we see the character John Nash a very intelligent man who has the ability to solve complex math equations with ease. John is a simple man who usually keeps to himself but has schizophrenia a disease that makes him
hallucinate and imagine things. When John is imagining these people like his best friend Charles he is taken away from the world and pays no attention to the world. After it is found out that John has schizophrenia his wife Alisha has him treated. When she believes he is taking his medicine she leaves to let John give the baby a bath. Knowing that he could potentially be dangerous; it was beyond her knowing that he was not taking his medicine. Not understanding how dangerous this was the baby almost drowned. This demonstrates how her knowing about his disease was not enough for her to understand what was going on in his head.

In personal response to the topic I believe that there are dangers that we face that we may not have understanding of, or are beyond our imagination. In personal experience; when I was young I was playing on a little pond with my brother. Only knowing that the water underneath was cold and that it was dangerous because you could get cold and sick. I had not paid enough attention to if the ice was thick. When I went running on to the ice and broke through I was scared. If it was not for my brother running to get our grandma, I could have drowned. To this day when I am ice fishing or anything I check the ice to see if it is thick enough. It was through my experience that I learned that there are dangers that can be overlooked or beyond a person's understanding.

Many people go into situations of danger and will do brave acts, but not knowing the possible outcome. It is a fact that there are dangers that are beyond our understanding and that a person has to experience them to learn. As demonstrated by the sailors in **H.M.S. ULYSSES** and John Nash in a **Beautiful Mind**, and how he became a danger to
himself and his family. And through my personal experience, I have found that in life we face dangers that may lie beyond our understandings.
### Example Paper—Proficient (Pf)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SCORING CRITERIA</th>
<th>RATIONALE</th>
<th>SCORE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Thought and Support (Pf)</td>
<td>• A well-considered understanding of the topic is demonstrated.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The student’s ideas are thoughtfully explored.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The literary example is related competently to the student’s ideas.</td>
<td>The literary example from <em>A Beautiful Mind</em> is related competently to the student’s idea in that even though Alicia understood “he could potentially be dangerous; it was beyond her knowing that he was not taking his medicine” and as a result “the baby almost drowned.”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Support is specific and relevant.</td>
<td>Support is specific and relevant, as in “With the most of the sailors thinking that enemy ships would be the biggest danger they probably did not think much about the elements,” “This demonstrates how her knowing about his disease was not enough for her to understand what was going on in his head,” and “To this day when I am ice fishing or anything I check to the ice to see if it is thick enough.”</td>
<td>Pf</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCORING CRITERIA</td>
<td>RATIONALE</td>
<td>SCORE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Form and Structure (Pf)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>Pf</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• A controlling idea or unifying effect is sustained throughout the response.</td>
<td>The <strong>controlling idea</strong> that “Many people go in to situation that could be potentially dangerous, but may not fully understand how bad it is” is sustained throughout the response.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Development of ideas and explanations is coherent.</td>
<td><strong>Development</strong> of ideas and explanations is <strong>coherent</strong> through the discussion of how “Without experience it was a real danger to the men,” “Knowing that he could potentially be dangerous; it was beyond her knowing that he was not taking his medicine,” and how the student “learned that there are dangers that can be over looked or beyond a persons understanding.”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The response moves to an appropriate closure.</td>
<td>The response moves to an <strong>appropriate closure</strong>.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Matters of Choice (Pf)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>Pf</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Diction is specific and generally effective.</td>
<td><strong>Diction</strong> is <strong>specific</strong> and <strong>generally effective</strong> (“beyond what they expected,” “solve complex math equations with ease,” and “brave acts”).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Many sentences appear to have been purposefully structured for effect.</td>
<td>Many <strong>sentences</strong> appear to have been <strong>purposefully structured</strong> for effect, as in “After it is found out that John has schizophrenia his wife Alisha has him treated,” and “If it was not for my brother running to get our grandma, I could have drowned.”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Stylistic choices contribute to the creation of a competent voice.</td>
<td><strong>Stylistic choices</strong>—“took a toll,” “usually keeps to himself,” “pays no attention to the world”—contribute to the creation of a <strong>competent voice</strong>.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCORING CRITERIA</td>
<td>RATIONALE</td>
<td>SCORE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Matters of Correctness (Pf)</strong></td>
<td>This writing demonstrates <strong>competent control</strong> of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics. (“Without experience it was a real danger to the men, but even with the ability of some people to imagine these potential dangers, they can be overwhelmed,” and “If it was not for my brother running to get our grandma, I could have drowned.”)</td>
<td>Pf</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Minor errors in mechanics, grammar, and/or complex language structures are understandable considering the circumstances.</td>
<td><strong>Minor errors in mechanics, grammar, and complex language</strong> structures are understandable considering the circumstances.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Betheene wants to change the world, by doing extreme things like going to war-torn countries and helping the sick and injured. He ends up dying in China while aiding the soldiers, as he contracted blood poisoning while caring for patients.
I definitely think that most people can't comprehend the danger involved with something until they personally experience a part of it. An example of this would be a mother constantly telling her child to stop pulling on the dog's ears or it would bite, but the child, through both ignorance and naivety, doesn't stop, and the dog bites. Forever on, the child would know not to pull the dog's ears. But before he had the experience of actually being bitten, he would never have been able to comprehend the danger.

I have had a personal experience along these lines as well. I have two boa constrictors as pets (very large snakes), and I believe I take good care of them. Whenever people want to hold them or touch them, I tell the people exactly what to do and don't do, as the book's

There is additional space for written work on pages 15, 17, and 19.
We never thought they'd bite me. I simply couldn't understand the risk as they had never so much as hissed at me. However, one day I was handling one, and I was doing exactly what I told everyone else not to do, dragging your fingers in front of their head. I remember when he bit my hand I was scared, but more embarrassed. I knew they had the potential to bite, yet never really believed it until it happened.

The character Norman Bethune from the play Bethune had the same goal. He was a doctor who really wanted to change the world for the better, and he felt he couldn't do it in America, due to their focus on capitalism and individualism. So he went to communist China, not only to see for the sick and wounded, but to improve their entire medical system. He seemed to understand the risks of working
in small, dirty conditions on the battlefield, as he lectured the other doctors and nurses on the importance of maintaining sanitation and hygiene. Yet when he himself contracted fatal blood poisoning from cross contamination, it was no one’s fault but his own for not having been more careful.

While these examples speak more towards the idea that people do not realize the real possibilities of something until they experience it, there is also the fact that people cannot comprehend the dangers of something they know nothing about. In the excerpt from H. H. SULLYSES, the man is describing all the dangers of being aboard the ship in a storm, just to play at the end that the words he used to describe the dangers meant almost nothing if you hadn’t experienced it already. This is very true, as having something told to you is completely and utterly different than experiencing it yourself.
**SCORING CRITERIA** | **RATIONALE** | **SCORE**
---|---|---
**Thought and Support (E)**<br>• An insightful understanding of the topic is demonstrated.<br>• The student’s ideas are perceptively explored.<br>• The literary example is related effectively to the student’s ideas.<br>• Support is precise and effective.<br>**An insightful understanding of the topic is demonstrated in the student’s discussion of the idea that ignorance and naiveté will prevent us from comprehending the true extent of the dangers we face until we have personally experienced them.**<br>The student’s ideas are perceptively explored through the discussions of how “the child, through both ignorance and naivety, doesn’t stop and the dog bites,” how “in my heart I knew that they were powerful animals, capable of doing great damage quickly, but I never thought they’d bite me,” and how Bethune’s death was his own fault “for not having been more careful.”<br>The literary example is related effectively to the student’s idea: “He ended up going to communist China, not only to care for the sick and wounded, but to improve their entire medical system,” “He seemed to understand the risks of working in small, dirty conditions on the battlefield,” and, despite this understanding, “he contracted fatal blood poisoning from cross contamination.”<br>**Support is precise and effective:** “However, one day I was handling one, and I was doing exactly what I told everyone else not to do, dangling your fingers in front of their head,” “when he bit my hand I was scared, but more embarassed,” and “the man is describing all the dangers of being aboard the ship in the storm, just to say at the end that the words he used to describe the dangers meant almost nothing if you hadn’t experienced it allready.”

**E**
## SCORING CRITERIA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Form and Structure (E)</th>
<th>RATIONALE</th>
<th>SCORE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A focused controlling idea or unifying effect is skillfully sustained throughout the response.</td>
<td>A focused controlling idea or unifying effect is skillfully sustained through the student’s discussion of the child and the dog, the personal experience with the snake, Bethune, and the excerpt.</td>
<td>E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of ideas and explanations is smooth and coherent.</td>
<td>Development of ideas and explanations is smooth and coherent through the discussion of how “before he had the experience of actually being bitten, he would never have been able to comprehend the danger,” “I knew they had the potential to bite, yet never really believed it until it happened,” and “having something told to you is completely and utterly different than learning it yourself.”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The response flows to an effective closure.</td>
<td>The response flows to an effective closure.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Matters of Choice (E)</th>
<th>RATIONALE</th>
<th>SCORE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Diction is precise and effective.</td>
<td>Diction—“through both ignorance and naivety,” “Bethune, had the same folly,” and “the importance of maintaining sanitation and hygiene”—is precise and effective.</td>
<td>E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Many sentences have been successfully structured for effect and are sometimes polished.</td>
<td>Many sentences have been successfully structured for effect (“I simply couldn’t understand the risk as they had never so much as hissed at me”) and are sometimes polished (“While these examples speak more towards the idea that people do not realize the real possibilities of something until they experience it, there is also the fact that people cannot comprehend the dangers of something they know nothing about.”)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stylistic choices contribute to the creation of a convincing voice.</td>
<td>Stylistic choices contribute to the creation of a convincing voice, as in “I guess in my heart I knew that they were powerful animals, capable of doing great damage quickly, but I never thought they’d bite me.”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCORING CRITERIA</td>
<td>RATIONALE</td>
<td>SCORE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Matters of Correctness (E)</td>
<td>The <strong>writing</strong> demonstrates <strong>confident control</strong> of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics, as in: “He ended up going to communist China, not only to care for the sick and wounded, but to improve their entire medical system,” and “He seemed to understand the risks of working in small, dirty conditions on the battlefield, as he lectured the other doctors and nurses on the importance of maintaining sanitation and hygiene.” The <strong>relative absence</strong> of <strong>error</strong> is impressive considering the complexity of the response and the circumstances.</td>
<td>E</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
This example (page 44) is unavailable for posting.
This example (page 45) is unavailable for posting.
This example (page 46) is unavailable for posting.
This example (page 47) is unavailable for posting.
Dear Prosper School Board:

Hello, I am Kerry Huxley; I recently graduated from Prosper High School and I am writing you in regards to the proposal for the Virtuosity Interactive System. Although this seems like it may be a good idea, I still do not think it would be a good idea to accept this system. There would be way too much time spent trying to get this system running properly and I do not believe that this device can recreate any historical period. Maybe I am wrong about this, but maybe we should let other schools be the ones to test it first.

One problem that might come up with this system is that we may spend way too much time working on fixing bugs and technical problems; this would cause way too much disruption to the students and staff members alike. This system would also probably be very expensive, money that we could spend on much more useful things, like new computers, working on some much needed repairs throughout the school or purchasing new text books. It would be much better for us to let other schools test this product out first and put our money towards something we can use much easier.

I spent lots of time going around asking for opinions on this new system, a former teacher of mine said “Any software is only as good as it’s designer,” I have personally never heard of Virtuosity, so why should I trust that their product is going to work as they advertise it to? Maybe this product is one of the most amazing things ever made but we don’t know that yet, which is why I think we should decline this offer and let the other schools test it out before we go and spend all of our money on it. The Citizen Action Committee said this, “Virtuosity has said that it will make the systems available to the trial schools at a reduced cost, but the company has
been vague on what that cost might be.” To me, it sounds like this is going to be a very expensive piece of equipment and we aren’t even sure how well it works.

I would like to thank you for taking your time to read my letter and consider what I have to say, if you would like to further discuss this or set up a meeting I can be contacted by email at kerryhuxley@yahoo.ca or by phone at 403-333-1131. I would like to thank you again, and I hope you make the right decision for your school.

Sincerely,

Kerry Huxley
### EXAMPLE PAPER—Proficient (Pf)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SCORING CRITERIA</th>
<th>RATIONALE</th>
<th>SCORE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Thought and Support (Pf)</td>
<td><strong>A thoughtful and competent understanding</strong> of the issue is demonstrated through the student’s awareness that not enough is known about the Virtuosity system to justify the risks and that “we should let other schools be the ones to test it first.”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• A thoughtful and competent understanding of the issue is demonstrated.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The student’s arguments are well considered and sound.</td>
<td>The student’s <strong>arguments</strong> that “I do not believe that this device can recreate any historical period,” that the school could spend money on “more useful things, like new computers,” and that “Maybe this product is one of the most amazing things ever made but we don’t know that yet” are <strong>well considered</strong> and <strong>sound</strong>.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Support is accurate and occasionally purposefully chosen to reinforce the student’s ideas in a logical and clear way.</td>
<td><strong>Support</strong>, such as “we may spend way too much time working on fixing bugs and technical problems” and “why should I trust that their product is going to work,” is <strong>accurate</strong>, and occasionally <strong>purposefully chosen</strong> to reinforce the student’s ideas in a <strong>logical</strong> and <strong>clear</strong> way, as in “It would be much better for us to let other schools test this product out first.”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Awareness of audience is sustained.</td>
<td>Awareness of <strong>audience</strong> is <strong>sustained</strong> by statements such as “It would be much better for us” and “put our money towards” and in the conclusion that “I would like to thank you again, and I hope you make the right decision for your school.”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCORING CRITERIA</td>
<td>RATIONALE</td>
<td>SCORE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Writing Skills (Pf)</td>
<td>• The selection and use of words and structures are frequently effective.</td>
<td>The selection and use of <em>words</em> and <em>structures</em>, such as “students and staff members alike,” “why should I trust that their product is going to work as they advertise it to?” and “I would like to thank you for taking your time to read my letter and consider what I have to say,” are <em>frequently effective.</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• This writing demonstrates competent control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics.</td>
<td>This <em>writing</em> demonstrates <em>competent control</em> of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics, as in “Maybe this product is one of the most amazing things ever made but we don’t know that yet, which is why I think we should decline this offer and let the other schools test it out before we go and spend all of our money on it.”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Dear Prosper School Council,

My name is Kerry Huxley and I am a recent graduate of Prosper High School. It has come to my attention that there is a debate whether or not to accept an offer made my Virtuosity regarding their virtual reality system. I believe that you should not accept this offer, as it will in fact weaken the learning system.

Although this system shows historical events, such as sailing on the Titanic, are we guaranteed that this is what actually happened? The only ones who would know what happened either perished as the event took place, or died soon after. There is no guarantee that what we will be seeing is completely, one hundred percent true. With our current learning system, however, we are able to do research to find out what all the important events were, which is what matters most. We do not need to be watching pointless conversations with people who are unimportant in history, nor do we need to see every minor detail. All we need to know is what happened, who it happened to, and what the results were.

Also, if you decide to continue to use Virtuosity’s program, your students will not learn the skills that an education would give them. The whole point of getting an education is to prepare the students for the world when they graduate. If they only use this program, they will not develop the reading, writing, and focusing skills that are vital in the outside world. The
students will learn more when they read what happened and develop their own ideas, than watching an inaccurate representation of what happened.

Thank you for your time, and I hope you consider what the important aspects are for an education when you make your decision on the offer.

Sincerely,

Kerry Huxley
EXAMPLE PAPER—Excellent (E)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SCORING CRITERIA</th>
<th>RATIONALE</th>
<th>SCORE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Thought and Support (E)</td>
<td>A perceptive and thorough understanding of the issue is demonstrated in the student’s assertion that “I believe that you should not accept this offer, as it will in fact weaken the learning system.”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The student’s arguments—“There is no guarantee that what we will be seeing is completely, one hundred percent true. With our current learning system, however, we are able to do research to find out what all the important events were, which is what matters most” and “Also, if you decide to continue to use Virtuosity’s program, your students will not learn the skills that an education would give them”—are adept and convincing.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Support is well defined and purposefully chosen to reinforce the student’s ideas in a deliberate and judicious way.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A precise awareness of audience is effectively sustained.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Support is well defined and purposefully chosen to reinforce the student’s ideas in a deliberate and judicious way.</td>
<td>Support is well defined and purposefully chosen to reinforce the student’s ideas in a deliberate and judicious way: “Although this system shows historical events, such as sailing on the Titanic, are we guaranteed that this is what actually happened,” “All we need to know is what happened, who it happened to, and what the results were,” and “The students will learn more when they read what happened and develop their own ideas, than watching an inaccurate representation of what happened.”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A precise awareness of audience is effectively sustained from the salutation “Dear Prosper School Council,” by statements such as “you should not accept this offer,” “our current learning system,” and “your students will not learn,” through to the concluding statement “Thank you for your time, and I hope you consider what the important aspects are for an education when you make your decision on the offer.”</td>
<td></td>
<td>E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCORING CRITERIA</td>
<td>RATIONALE</td>
<td>SCORE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Writing Skills (E)</td>
<td>The selection and use of words and structures are effective.</td>
<td>E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The selection and use of words (“perished,” “pointless,” and “inaccurate”) and structures (“If they only use this program, they will not develop the reading, writing, and focusing skills that are vital in the outside world”) are effective.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>This writing demonstrates confident control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Scoring Categories and Criteria

Ideas and Impressions (5% of total examination mark)

Cross-reference to the Program of Studies for Senior High School English Language Arts 2.1 2.2 2.3 4.1

When marking Ideas and Impressions, the marker should consider

- the quality of the ideas generated by the student to explore the visual text(s) and the impressions that the student has formed to reflect upon the visual text(s)
- the effectiveness and consistency of the support provided

Excellent (E) The student’s perceptions are insightful and carefully considered. Support is precise, purposefully chosen, and strongly connected to the student’s ideas and impressions.

Proficient (Pf) The student’s perceptions are thoughtful and considered. Support is relevant, detailed, and clearly connected to the student’s ideas and impressions.

Satisfactory (S) The student’s perceptions are appropriate but may be generalized. Support is adequate and generally connected to the student’s ideas and impressions.

Limited (L) The student’s perceptions are superficial or ambiguous. Support is imprecise, unclear, and/or vaguely connected to the student’s ideas and impressions.

Poor (P) The student’s perceptions are underdeveloped or incomprehensible. Support is lacking, inappropriate, or unrelated to the student’s ideas and impressions.

Insufficient (INS) • The marker can discern no evidence of an attempt to fulfill the assignment OR • The writing is so deficient in length that it is not possible to assess Ideas and Impressions.
**Scoring Categories and Scoring Criteria for 2009–2010 Assignment I: Visual Reflection**

**Presentation (5% of total examination mark)**  
Cross-reference to the *Program of Studies for Senior High School English Language Arts 3.1 3.2 4.1 4.2*

When marking **Presentation**, the marker should consider

- **the effectiveness of voice** and its appropriateness to the intended audience of the prose form that the student has chosen
- **the quality of language and expression**
- **the appropriateness of development and unifying effect** to prose form

**Consider the proportion of error in terms of the complexity and length of the response.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Score</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Excellent (E)</strong></td>
<td>The student’s voice is engaging and the tone is confident. Stylistic choices are precise and effective. The writing is skillfully developed, and the unifying effect is confidently sustained.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Proficient (Pf)</strong></td>
<td>The student’s voice is distinct and the tone is well considered. Stylistic choices are specific and frequently effective. The writing is coherently developed, and the unifying effect is capably sustained.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Satisfactory (S)</strong></td>
<td>The student’s voice is matter-of-fact and the tone is appropriate. Stylistic choices are adequate and occasionally effective. The writing is generally clearly developed, and the unifying effect is appropriately sustained.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Limited (L)</strong></td>
<td>The student’s voice is inconsistent and/or the tone is inappropriate. Stylistic choices are inappropriate, imprecise, and often ineffective. The writing is unclearly or incoherently developed, and the unifying effect is not sustained.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Poor (P)</strong></td>
<td>The student’s voice is confused and/or there is no discernible attempt to address the intended audience. Stylistic choices are ineffective and/or impede communication. The writing is ineffectively developed, and/or a unifying effect is absent.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Scoring Categories and Scoring Criteria for 2009–2010 Assignment II: Literary Exploration

Thought and Support (10% of total examination mark)

Cross-reference to the Program of Studies for Senior High School English Language Arts 2.1 2.3 3.2 4.1 4.2

When marking Thought and Support, the marker should consider how effectively

- the student’s ideas reflect an understanding of the topic
- the literary example relates to the student’s ideas
- the support explains and/or clarifies the response

Consider ideas presented in the Personal Reflection on Choice of Character(s) from Literary Text(s).

Excellent (E) An insightful understanding of the topic is demonstrated. The student’s ideas are perceptively explored. The literary example is related effectively to the student’s ideas. Support is precise and effective.

Proficient (Pf) A well-considered understanding of the topic is demonstrated. The student’s ideas are thoughtfully explored. The literary example is related competently to the student’s ideas. Support is specific and relevant.

Satisfactory (S) A defensible understanding of the topic is demonstrated. The student’s ideas are appropriately and straightforwardly explored. The literary example is related adequately to the student’s ideas. Support is relevant but tends to be general.

Limited (L) An understanding of the topic may be evident but is only partially demonstrated or is not always defensible or sustained. The student’s ideas may be incompletely or unclearly explored. The literary example is lacking or does not relate adequately to the student’s ideas. Support may be deficient, vague, redundant, or marginally relevant.

Poor (P) An implausible conjecture concerning the topic may be suggested. The student’s ideas, if present, are irrelevant, incomprehensible, or unexplored. The literary example is absent or unrelated to the student’s ideas. Support, if present, is overgeneralized or of questionable relevance.

Insufficient (INS) • The marker can discern no evidence of an attempt to fulfill the assignment OR • The writing is so deficient in length that it is not possible to assess Thought and Support.

Because students’ responses to the Literary Exploration Assignment vary widely—from philosophical discussions to personal narratives to creative approaches—assessment of the Literary Exploration Assignment on the diploma examination will be in the context of Louise Rosenblatt’s suggestion:

... the evaluation of the answers would be in terms of the amount of evidence that the youngsters has actually read something and thought about it, not a question of whether, necessarily, he has thought about it the way an adult would, or given an adult’s “correct” answer.

Form and Structure (5% of total examination mark)

Cross-reference to the Program of Studies for Senior High School English Language Arts 2.2 3.1 4.1 4.2

When marking Form and Structure, the marker should consider how effectively the student's organizational choices result in

- the development and maintenance of a controlling idea or unifying effect
- the creation of a coherent, shaped, and concluded discussion in response to the assignment

Excellent (E) A focused controlling idea or unifying effect is skillfully sustained throughout the response. Development of ideas and explanations is smooth and coherent. The response flows to an effective closure.

Proficient (Pf) A controlling idea or unifying effect is sustained throughout the response. Development of ideas and explanations is coherent. The response moves to an appropriate closure.

Satisfactory (S) A controlling idea or unifying effect is evident, but unity may falter on occasion. Development of ideas and explanations is generally clear and coherent. The response moves to a functional closure.

Limited (L) A controlling idea or unifying effect may be evident, but the response lacks unity. Development of ideas and explanations is uncertain, inadequate, or incoherent. The response may not arrive at an appropriate closure.

Poor (P) A controlling idea or unifying effect is absent. Development of ideas and explanations is unclear and ineffective. The response closes ineffectively.
### Scoring Categories and Scoring Criteria for 2009–2010 Assignment II: Literary Exploration

#### Matters of Choice (5% of total examination mark)

Cross-reference to the Program of Studies for Senior High School English Language Arts 4.2

When marking **Matters of Choice**, the marker should consider how effectively the student’s choices enhance communication. The marker should consider:

- **diction**, including connotative language, imagery, idiomatic expressions, and dialect
- **syntax**, including such choices as parallelism, balance, inversion, sentence length, and variety
- the contribution of stylistic choices to the creation of **voice**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Excellent (E)</th>
<th>Diction is precise and effective. Many sentences have been successfully structured for effect and are sometimes polished. Stylistic choices contribute to the creation of a convincing voice.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Proficient (Pf)</td>
<td>Diction is specific and generally effective. Many sentences appear to have been purposefully structured for effect. Stylistic choices contribute to the creation of a competent voice.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Satisfactory (S)</td>
<td>Diction is appropriate but may be general rather than specific. Sentence structures are generally straightforward and clear. Stylistic choices contribute to the creation of a clear voice.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limited (L)</td>
<td>Diction is imprecise and/or inappropriate. Sentence structures are frequently ineffective and/or awkward. Inadequate stylistic choices contribute to the creation of an uncertain or unclear voice.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poor (P)</td>
<td>Diction is inaccurate and/or overgeneralized. Sentence structures are misused to such an extent that clarity suffers. A lack of stylistic choices contributes to the creation of an ineffective voice.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Scoring Categories and Scoring Criteria for 2009–2010 Assignment II: Literary Exploration

Matters of Correctness (5% of total examination mark)
Cross-reference to the Program of Studies for Senior High School English Language Arts 4.2

When marking Matters of Correctness, the marker should consider the correctness of

• sentence construction (completeness, consistency, subordination, coordination, predication)
• usage (accurate use of words according to convention and meaning)
• grammar (subject-verb/pronoun-antecedent agreement, pronoun reference, consistency of tense)
• mechanics (punctuation, spelling, capitalization)

Consider the proportion of error in terms of the complexity and length of the response.

Excellent (E) This writing demonstrates confident control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics. The relative absence of error is impressive considering the complexity of the response and the circumstances.

Proficient (Pf) This writing demonstrates competent control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics. Minor errors in mechanics, grammar, and/or complex language structures are understandable considering the circumstances.

Satisfactory (S) This writing demonstrates control of the basics of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics. There may be occasional lapses in control of sentence construction and usage, and/or minor errors in grammar and mechanics. The communication, however, is clear.

Limited (L) This writing demonstrates faltering control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics. The range of sentence construction problems and errors in usage, grammar, and/or mechanics blur the clarity of communication.

Poor (P) This writing demonstrates lack of control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics. The unclear and incorrect sentence constructions and jarring errors in usage, grammar, and mechanics impede communication.
**Scoring Categories and Scoring Criteria for 2009–2010 Assignment III: Persuasive Writing in Context**

**Thought and Support** (10% of total examination mark)

Cross-reference to the Program of Studies for Senior High School English Language Arts 2.1 2.2 2.3 4.1 4.2

When marking Thought and Support, the marker should consider

- how effectively the student has addressed the **significance** and **complexity** of the issue
- the **persuasiveness** and **consistency** of the argument(s) presented
- how well the supporting evidence is integrated, synthesized, and/or developed to support the student’s arguments
- awareness of **audience** and effectiveness of **voice**

**Excellent (E)**

A perceptive and thorough understanding of the issue is demonstrated. The student’s arguments are adept and convincing. Support is well defined and purposefully chosen to reinforce the student’s ideas in a deliberate and judicious way. A precise awareness of audience is effectively sustained.

**Proficient (Pf)**

A thoughtful and competent understanding of the issue is demonstrated. The student’s arguments are well considered and sound. Support is accurate and occasionally purposefully chosen to reinforce the student’s ideas in a logical and clear way. Awareness of audience is sustained.

**Satisfactory (S)**

A sufficient but generalized understanding of the issue is demonstrated. The student’s arguments are appropriate and straightforward. Support is relevant but general, and may be occasionally lacking in persuasiveness and consistency. Awareness of audience is generally sustained.

**Limited (L)**

An incomplete, vague, or confused understanding of the issue is demonstrated. The student’s arguments are oversimplified and/or inconsistent. Support is superficial, unclear, contradictory, inappropriate, or merely a restatement of what is provided in the examination. Awareness of audience may be apparent but is not sustained.

**Poor (P)**

An inaccurate or minimal understanding of the issue is demonstrated. The student’s arguments are of questionable logic or are unrelated to the issue under discussion. Support is irrelevant, overgeneralized, or lacking. Little awareness of audience is apparent.

**Insufficient (INS)**

- The marker can discern no evidence of an attempt to fulfill the assignment OR
- The writing is so deficient in length that it is not possible to assess Thought and Support.
**Scoring Categories and Scoring Criteria for 2009–2010 Assignment III: Persuasive Writing in Context**

**Writing Skills** (5% of total examination mark)

Cross-reference to the *Program of Studies for Senior High School English Language Arts* 4.2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>When marking <strong>Writing Skills</strong>, the marker should consider the extent to which the writing demonstrates control of</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• syntax</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• diction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• grammar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• mechanics</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Consider the proportion of error in terms of the complexity and length of the response.

| Excellent (E) | The selection and use of words and structures are effective. This writing demonstrates confident control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics. |
| Proficient (Pf) | The selection and use of words and structures are frequently effective. This writing demonstrates competent control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics. |
| Satisfactory (S) | The selection and use of words and structures are occasionally effective. This writing demonstrates basic control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics. |
| Limited (L) | The selection and use of words and structures are frequently ineffective. This writing demonstrates faltering control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics. |
| Poor (P) | The selection and use of words and structures are ineffective. This writing demonstrates lack of control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics. |