

# Examples of the Standards for Students' Writing

# English Language Arts 30–1

From the June 2011 Diploma Examination

- Personal Response to Texts Assignment
- Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Government  
of Alberta ■

*Alberta* ■

Freedom To Create. Spirit To Achieve.

This document was written primarily for:

Students	✓
Teachers	✓
Administrators	✓
Parents	✓
General Public	✓
Others	

Copyright 2011, the Crown in Right of Alberta, as represented by the Minister of Education, Alberta Education, Assessment Sector, 44 Capital Boulevard, 10044 108 Street NW, Edmonton, Alberta T5J 5E6, and its licensors. All rights reserved.

**Special permission** is granted to **Alberta educators only** to reproduce, for educational purposes and on a non-profit basis, parts of this document that do **not** contain excerpted material.

Excerpted material in this document **shall not** be reproduced without the written permission of the original publisher (see credits, where applicable).

## *Contents*

<b>Acknowledgements</b>	ii
<b>Introduction</b>	1
<b>English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011 Writing Assignments</b>	3
Personal Response to Texts Assignment	4
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment	10
<b>English Language Arts 30–1 Part A: Written Response Standards Confirmation</b>	12
<b>Examples of Students’ Writing with Teachers’ Commentaries</b>	13
English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011 Personal Response to Texts Assignment	13
English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011 Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment	45
<b>Scoring Categories and Criteria</b>	76

## *Acknowledgements*

Publication of this document would not have been possible without the permission of the students whose writing is presented. The co-operation of these students has allowed us to continue illustrating the standards of writing performance expected in the context of diploma examinations and demonstrate the variety of approaches taken by students in their writing.

This document includes the valuable contributions of many educators. Sincere thanks and appreciation are extended to the following Standards Confirmers: Monica Gackle, Colleen Hetherington, Gary Hoogers, Stefan Johnson, Brad Kaminsky, Shalini Kapoor, Debra Leslie, Janine Metzner Huizing, and Christine Nesdoly.

We gratefully acknowledge the contributions made by members of the Humanities Unit and the Document Design and Desktop Publishing Unit of the Assessment Sector, Alberta Education.

You can reach us with your comments and questions by email to [Barbara.Proctor-Hartley@gov.ab.ca](mailto:Barbara.Proctor-Hartley@gov.ab.ca), [Heather.Wheatland@gov.ab.ca](mailto:Heather.Wheatland@gov.ab.ca), or [Tim.Coates@gov.ab.ca](mailto:Tim.Coates@gov.ab.ca), or by regular mail at

Alberta Education  
Box 43  
44 Capital Boulevard  
10044 108 Street NW  
Edmonton, Alberta T5J 5E6

We would be pleased to hear from you.

## ***Introduction***

The written responses in this document are examples of English Language Arts 30–1 Diploma Examination writing that received scores of Satisfactory (S), Proficient (Pf), or Excellent (E). These sample responses are taken from the June 2011 administration. Along with the commentaries that accompany them, they should help you and your students to understand the standards for English Language Arts 30–1 Diploma Examination writing in relation to the scoring criteria.

The purpose of the sample responses is to illustrate the standards that governed the June 2011 marking session. The sample papers and the commentaries were used to train markers to apply the scoring criteria consistently and to justify their decisions about scores in terms of each student's work and the criteria.

The sample responses included in this document represent a very small sample of successful approaches to the assignments.

## ***Selection and Use of Sample Papers***

The teachers on the Standards Confirmation Committee for the June 2011 marking session selected the examples of student responses included here. They also wrote the commentaries that discuss the students' writing in terms of the scoring criteria used for marking.

During their preparation for the June 2011 marking session, markers reviewed and validated the standards represented by these sample responses. Markers then used these sample responses as guidelines for marking the written-response sections of the June 2011 English Language Arts 30–1 Diploma Examination.

## ***Cautions***

### **1. The commentaries are brief.**

The commentaries were written for groups of markers to discuss and apply during the marking session. Although brief, they provide a model for relating specific examples from student work to the details in a specific scoring criterion.

### **2. Neither the scoring guide nor the assignments are meant to limit students to a single organizational or rhetorical approach in completing any diploma examination assignment.**

Students must be free to select and organize their materials in a manner that they feel will enable them to best present their ideas. In fact, part of what is being assessed is the final effectiveness of the content, the form and structure, and the rhetorical choices that students make.

The student writing in this document illustrates *just a few of the many* successful organizational and rhetorical strategies used in June 2011.

We strongly recommend that you caution your students that there is *no preferred approach* to an assignment except the approach that best accomplishes the student writer's goal of effectively communicating his or her own ideas about the topic.

We advise you not to draw any conclusions about common patterns of approach taken by students.

**3. The sample papers presented in this document must not be used as models for instructional purposes.**

Because these papers are illustrations only, and because they are sample responses to a set topic, students must be cautioned not to memorize the content of any of these assignments or to use them when completing classroom assignments or when writing future diploma examinations.

The *approaches* taken by students at the *standard of excellence*, not their words or ideas, are what students being examined in the future should consider emulating. In fact, it is hoped that the variety of approaches presented here will inspire students to experiment with diction, syntax, form, and structure as a way of developing an individual voice and engaging the reader in ideas and forms that the student has considered.

Examination markers and staff at Alberta Education take any possibility of plagiarism or cheating seriously. The consequences for students are grave.

**4. It is essential that you consider each of these examples of student writing in light of the constraints of the examination situation.**

Under examination conditions, students produce *first-draft writing*. Given more time, students would be expected to produce papers of considerably improved quality, particularly in the dimensions of Presentation, Matters of Correctness, and Writing Skills.

**5. For further information regarding student performance on the Part A: Written Response, access the [\*English Language Arts 30–1 Assessment Highlights\*](#).**

*English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011*  
*Writing Assignments*

*June 2011*

*English Language Arts 30–1*  
*Part A: Written Response*

*Grade 12 Diploma Examination*

*Description*

**Time: 2½ hours.** This examination was developed to be completed in 2½ hours; however, you may take an additional ½ hour to complete the examination.

Plan your time carefully.

**Part A: Written Response** contributes 50% of the total English Language Arts 30–1 Diploma Examination mark and consists of two assignments.

- **Personal Response to Texts Assignment**  
Value 20% of total examination mark
- **Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**  
Value 30% of total examination mark

**Recommendation:** Read and reflect upon the whole examination before you begin to write. Time spent in planning may result in better writing.

*Do not write your name anywhere in this booklet. Feel free to make corrections and revisions directly on your written work.*

*Instructions*

- Complete the Personal Response to Texts Assignment first. The Personal Response to Texts Assignment is designed to allow you time to think and reflect upon the ideas that you may also explore in the Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment.
- Complete **both** assignments.
- You may use the following print references:
  - an English and/or bilingual dictionary
  - a thesaurus
  - an authorized writing handbook
- Space is provided in this booklet for planning and for your written work.
- Use blue or black ink for your written work.

*Additional Instructions for Students Using Word Processors*

- Format your work using an easy-to-read 12-point or larger font such as Times.
- Double-space your final copy.
- Staple your final printed work to the pages indicated for word-processed work for each assignment. Hand in all work.
- Indicate in the space provided on the back cover that you have attached word-processed pages.

## PERSONAL RESPONSE TO TEXTS ASSIGNMENT

**Suggested time: approximately 45 to 60 minutes**

Carefully read and consider the texts on pages 1 to 4, and then complete the assignment that follows.

### **The Stricken Children**

The Wishing Well was a spring  
bubbling clear and soundless into a shallow pool  
less than three feet across, a hood of rocks  
protecting it, smallest of grottoes, from falling leaves,  
the pebbles of past wishes peacefully under-water, old desires  
forgotten or fulfilled. No one threw money in, one had to search  
for the right small stone.

This was the place from which  
year after year in childhood I demanded my departure,  
my journeying forth into the world of magical  
cities, mountains, otherness—the place which gave  
what I asked, and more; to which  
still wandering, I returned this year, as if  
to gaze once more at the face  
of an ancient grandmother.  
And I found the well  
filled to the shallow brim  
with debris of a culture's sickness—  
with bottles, tins, paper, plastic—  
the soiled bandages  
of its aching unconsciousness.

Does the clogged spring still moisten  
the underlayer of waste?  
Was it children threw in the rubbish?  
Children who don't dream, or dismiss  
their own desires and  
toss them down, discarded packaging?  
I move away, walking fast, the impetus  
of so many journeys pushes me on,  
but where are the stricken children of this time, this place,  
to travel to, in Time if not in Place,  
the grandmother wellspring choked, and themselves not aware  
of all they are doing-without?

*Denise Levertov*



*In this excerpt from a novel set partly in 19th-century France, young displaced newlyweds Roman and Marie-Neige rent a small farm neighbouring the Segura estate. Whenever he could, Roman worked as a carpenter on local construction sites. The wealthy Madame Segura welcomed the couple as company for her son Lucien and taught Marie-Neige to read as she supervised Lucien's studies.*

**from DIVISADERO**

Whenever Marie-Neige returned from visiting her husband in prison, she walked the periphery of their two fields—one that surrounded the barn like a horseshoe, and a larger one that sloped uphill. Roman had boarded horses and pigs for neighbouring farmers, and this had brought in minimal subsistence. Now, with him in jail, she could hardly keep up. But walking the property at dusk made its possibilities clearer. She could live on what she grew within the horseshoe and turn the larger field into a market garden. But she had to learn how to replenish the fields. The animals they boarded had ripped open the earth. So she began to fork manure and vegetable remains and fire ash into the earth, and took the wagon to the slaughterhouse in Marseillan to bring back offal and the remnants of carcasses, which were like gold. Needing a darker, loamier soil, she sprinkled chimney soot over the rows where she had planted cabbage, dragged lime and ammonia through the claylike soil, and used cow dung where it was sandy and horse manure where it was chalk. Some of this she already knew. The rest she discovered in a monograph she borrowed from Lucien's library that showed how earth was renewed in an old battle zone. All this reminded her of the book where Cornelius<sup>1</sup> tried to grow a perfect black tulip.

She bundled weeds at the edge of the larger field and let them dry, and a week later heaped them all into a fire. The acrid smell drifted downhill to Lucien's house and slipped into his workroom, so that he came to the window and watched her in the distance, outlined by smoke and flame. She trod seeds into the earth instead of broadcasting them with her hands. They called this *plombage* in Lucien's military monograph. She cut down brush and left just a few fruit trees along the fences. In the new vegetable gardens, she discouraged sparrows by laying out white cotton along the seedbeds, and dissected earthworms and dipped them in nux vomica, then slipped them into mole holes. She was as gentle with seedlings as she was brutal with pests. She loosened the moist earth and carried the bundle of shoots in her cupped hands as if it were a fallen bird to be returned to its nest. She saw her work now as a path through the seasons, seeding onions and celery between February and April, leeks and winter cabbage from May to July.

She was older now. She had wept when she married, and then had seen her new husband try to murder someone during the darkness of her marriage night. He was a man who had grown up with the harsh etiquette of self-protection he had witnessed on a farm. But the world they were in was harsher. And Roman was now in a prison, having attacked a man near the square base of the belfry, almost killing him in a rage of jealousy. It had taken seven men to hold him down. As if he were a stag. When he had looked down at her among the carpenters from that great height, he did not know she was pregnant.

Marie-Neige visited him every week in his cell in Marseillan. A month after he was imprisoned, while walking home, she had a miscarriage. She lay down in a stranger's

<sup>1</sup>Cornelius—Cornelius van Baerle in *The Black Tulip*, a novel set in 1672 by Alexander Dumas. The plot line involves a competition to grow the first black tulip, the trade in exotic varieties being both lucrative and competitive.

ditch and lost all of what she and Roman had created. She got up after an hour. One rich thistle had been growing next to Marie-Neige, and it became burned within her memory. She tied two sticks together into a cross and planted it by the roadside, gathered whatever was there into a fold of her yellow cotton dress, and brought it home and buried it in the horseshoe-shaped field near the house.

She saw her life then for what it was. There would always be this pointless and impotent dreaming on farms, and there would always be a rich man on horseback who galloped across the world, riding into a forest just to inhale its wet birch leaves after a storm.

“Where is your yellow dress?” Lucien asked when giving her a lift into Marseillan, and her answer stuttered into silence. One evening shortly afterwards, she and Lucien talked for long hours into the night. Roman was still in prison, and she believed she herself did not have much more than the fate of a mule. She spoke to Lucien about everything, confessing her poverty, and he admitted his unawareness. Even though he was her closest neighbour, he had been preoccupied by his own life.

He went to Marseillan and bought the property she lived on outright from the Simone family, partly with money and partly with an exchange of fields. A day or so later, everything was notarized and he walked up the hill to her farmhouse with the papers. He saw her by the well and called out her name, but she did not move. She kept staring down into the well. He came up to her, and her focus of intent hesitated at the sound of his voice and she turned to him. She had heard the news that someone was buying the farmhouse. He took her hand and she jerked it back. But he would not let go. He pulled her that way towards the house....

He made her sit at the blue table. It was the table he would take away from that small farmhouse some years later, and it became the dearest possession in his life. She sat on his right, and he spread out the bill of sale in front of them. He went over all the clauses, reading them, explaining them. It was something other than shock when she noticed her name. She’d been given nothing in her life, on even the slightest scale.

Then, a few minutes later, only halfway through the document, she relaxed, and he sensed it immediately.

What is it? he asked. She shook her head and kept reading the paper before her. There’d been no gasp of breath or gesture, but he was so familiar with her nature he’d recognized the sudden lightness. What is it? he said again.

She watched him, smiling. Nothing, she said.

It was not connected with this grand gesture and the gift of property, but some realization by her that made the acceptance of it possible. They were old allies. And only she knew why, when they sat down side by side at the table, she had known automatically which of the two chairs to sit in. It was so his good eye would be next to her and could share the page they read together, while the other eye—his blindness, at all their differences in this life—was far from this intimacy.

She made a sparrow’s dinner for them, and needing something to praise, he praised the freshness of her well water until she was laughing at him.... He could sense her excitement about the farm’s possibilities, now that she owned the land. At one point during their meal he even said what had crossed her mind already—that she was now entering the world of the grower of the black tulip. She nodded. They were as close as that.

*Michael Ondaatje*



©2010 David S. Waitz

*David S. Waitz*

**PERSONAL RESPONSE TO TEXTS ASSIGNMENT****Suggested time: approximately 45 to 60 minutes**

You have been provided with three texts on pages 1 to 4. In Denise Levertov's poem "The Stricken Children," the speaker laments a personal loss. In the excerpt from *Divisadero* by Michael Ondaatje, the privileged Lucien Segura helps Marie-Neige recover from a desperate situation. In David S. Waitz's untitled photo montage, a man stands in a glass booth.

**The Assignment**

**What do these texts suggest about the role adversity plays in shaping an individual's identity? Support your idea(s) with reference to one or more of the texts presented and to your previous knowledge and/or experience.**

**In your writing, you must**

- use a prose form
- connect one or more of the texts provided in this examination to your own ideas and impressions

Fold and tear along perforation.

## Personal Response to Texts Assignment

### *Initial Planning*

To which of the provided texts are you responding? What is the connection between the text(s) and your response?

---

---

---

---

What idea do you intend to explore and how does it address the topic?

---

---

---

---

State your choice of prose form. Choose from prose forms that you have practised in English Language Arts 30–1. You may respond using a personal, creative, or analytical perspective. Do NOT use a poetic form.

---

There is additional space for planning on the following unlined pages.

**CRITICAL/ANALYTICAL RESPONSE TO LITERARY TEXTS ASSIGNMENT****Suggested time: approximately 1½ to 2 hours**

Do *not* use the texts provided in this booklet for the Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment. Choose from short stories, novels, plays, screenplays, poetry, films, or other literary texts that you have studied in English Language Arts 30–1. When considering the works that you have studied, choose a literary text (or texts) that is meaningful to you and relevant to the following assignment.

**The Assignment**

**Discuss the idea(s) developed by the text creator in your chosen text about the role adversity plays in shaping an individual's identity.**

*In your planning and writing, consider the following instructions.*

- Carefully consider your *controlling idea* and how you will create a strong *unifying effect* in your response.
- As you develop your ideas, support them with appropriate, relevant, and meaningful examples from your choice of literary text(s).

Fold and tear along perforation.

## Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

### *Initial Planning*

You may use this space for your initial planning. This information assists markers in identifying the text you have chosen to support your ideas. The markers who read your composition will be very familiar with the literary text you have chosen.

Literary Text and  
Text Creator

---

---

---

---

*Note:* Write the title of your chosen literary text on the back cover of this examination booklet.

### ***Personal Reflection on Choice of Literary Text***

**Suggested time: 10 to 15 minutes**

Briefly explore your reasons for selecting the literary text as support for your response. Markers will consider the information you provide here when considering the effectiveness of your supporting evidence.

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

Additional space is provided for *Personal Reflection on Choice of Literary Text* on the following page.



## ***English Language Arts 30–1 Part A: Written Response Standards Confirmation***

### ***Background***

For all diploma examination scoring sessions, Assessment Sector staff use a process of standards confirmation to establish and illustrate expectations for students' work in relation to the scoring criteria and to ensure scoring consistency within and between marking sessions. Because there are several diploma examination administrations and scoring sessions each school year, the standards must remain consistent for each scoring session in the school year and, similarly, from year to year.

Standards for student achievement start with both the demands of the [Program of Studies](#) for senior high school English Language Arts and the interpretation of those demands through learning resources and classroom instruction. These agreed-upon standards are also exemplified in the kinds of tasks and the degree of independence expected of students. All these complex applications of standards precede the design, development, and scoring of each diploma examination.

The Standards Confirmation Committee is composed of experienced teachers from representative regions of the province. These teachers work with the Assessment Sector staff responsible for the development, scoring, and results-reporting for each diploma examination. Teacher-members participate over a two-year period and are required to serve as group leaders or markers during at least one of the subsequent marking sessions.

There are two essential parts to applying standards at the point of examination scoring: the expectations embedded in the scoring criteria and the examples of students' work that illustrate the scoring criteria within each scoring category. The scoring categories and scoring criteria are available to teachers and students via the [English Language Arts 30–1 Information Bulletin](#). During each of the January and June marking sessions, example papers selected by members of the Standards Confirmation Committee are used to train markers. Subsequent to each marking session, the example papers that received scores of Satisfactory (S), Proficient (Pf), and Excellent (E) are posted on the Alberta Education website at [education.alberta.ca](http://education.alberta.ca) in the documents entitled [Examples of the Standards for Students' Writing](#).

During the standards confirmation process,

- the appropriateness of the standards set by the examination in relation to students' work is confirmed
- student responses that clearly illustrate the standards in the scoring categories and the scoring criteria are selected and are used when training markers
- rationales that explain and support the selection of sample papers in terms of the scoring categories, scoring criteria, and students' work are written



## *Examples of Students' Writing with Teachers' Commentaries*

The Assessment Sector diligently attempts to secure student permission to post all of the Examples of Student Writing.

In the case of the Satisfactory–1 Personal Response to Texts Assignment for June 2011, however, permission to use the student's response was not granted.

English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011  
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Satisfactory–2 (S)

*Initial Planning*

To which of the provided texts are you responding? What is the connection between the text(s) and your response?

Excerpt - Divisadero - showing her hardship from a  
more personal inner side

What idea do you intend to explore and how does it address the topic?

- loss of hope for the future but finding  
strength through the challenges presented.

State your choice of prose form. Choose from prose forms that you have practised in English Language Arts 30–1. You may respond using a personal, creative, or analytical perspective. Do NOT use a poetic form.

inner (sort of) monologue. from Marc-Neige's perspective

English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011  
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Satisfactory–2 (S)

→ adversity: condition of unhappiness, misfortune or distress <sup>Planning</sup>

English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011  
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Satisfactory–2 (S)

**As Strong As the Well**

Personal Response

My stomach churned as I stared into the well. The water shimmered like a giant tear about to fall. I was beyond tears, I could not cry for this, it must be fate... fate for my heart to be broken once more. I heard the land was sold, someone bought it a couple days ago, the Simone's told me this morning. I would have to find another home, another way to make ends meet. How is this fair? How is it fair that I am all alone, I work hard, I have done nothing wrong, and yet I am receiving the short end of the stick over and over and over again. Even though I do not know who the buyers are, I wish I could meet them and show them the land. I would show them the hard work I have put into these fields, to prove the hours of exhaustion that pay for my living. I would show them what it's like to be alone out here, newly wed and without a husband. I would show them my lost child that I buried under the trees by the garden. I would want them to see that I have a face and not just someone who can move and go somewhere else. I deserve this place, I have fought to live here! I slam my fist against the stone edge of the well, wishing something or someone could understand my pain, feel my side. A piece of the rock falls in. The water ripples but all I get is a throbbing hand. I am so sick of this! I am sick of fighting a seemingly never ending battle. I just want a break . I just wanted Roman back...

Lucien, my neighbour, is coming through the yard, calling my name. I pretend I don't see him and look away. He shouldn't see me like this. I just want to be left alone. Staring blindly into the well, I wish I could dive into it and swim to a better place, somewhere not here. Suddenly I feel someone take my hand, I try to jerk it away. It is Lucien, he has a sad smile on

(Page 3 of 4)

English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011  
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Satisfactory–2 (S)

his face which I don't want to see. I don't want his pity, I need to be strong on my own.

Nobody can help me now. It makes me angry when he insisted on holding my hand, he wouldn't let go until he had lead me inside and I was sitting at the blue table. He laid out some papers for me to look at. At first, I don't understand. But he continues to read and explain the papers. Bill of sale... rights to the land...prices...wait, what?? Why was my name on these papers?! I look up to Lucien when I realize what he had done. He looks to me out of his good eye with a face of kindness. I can't believe it...the farm is mine? A smile is spreading across my face and I feel like I can breath again. I can barely contain my happiness but out of my pride and stubbornness I try to mask it. As much as I tried to hide it though Lucien obviously noticed, he's smiling too.

I made him a small supper out of what I had as a thank you in the best way that I could, though nothing could really match the gift he had given me. Searching for to give a compliment, he commented on the freshness of the well water. I thought of the small stone that slipped into the well, I laughed with him, praising how such a great occasion came out of such a time of difficulty. Never again would I stop and let myself wallow in my misfortune. I am a strong woman and these hardships have only made me stronger. Now that I have the farm, I feel as though I can do anything. After being so low, there is nothing that can hold me down.

**English Language Arts 30–1 June 2011  
Personal Response to Texts Assignment**

**EXAMPLE PAPER—SATISFACTORY–2**

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p><b>Ideas and Impressions (S)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The student’s exploration of the topic is generalized.</li> <li>• Perceptions and/or ideas are straightforward and relevant.</li> <li>• Support is adequate and clarifies the student’s ideas and impressions.</li> </ul>	<p>The Initial Planning page indicates the student’s intention to show Marie-Neige’s “hardship from a more personal inner side” using an “inner (sort of) monologue” (1). By focusing on the distress caused for the protagonist by the sale of the farm, and the subsequent relief created by Lucien’s purchase of the land, the student <b>generally</b> explores the controlling idea that Marie-Neige suffers a “loss of hope for the future but finding strength through the challenges presented” (1). The student offers <b>straightforward and relevant ideas</b> about Marie-Neige’s emotional response to her adversity, beginning with her desperation at learning the land has been sold “My stomach churned as I stared into the well” (3), moving to her anger at the thought of losing all she has worked for “I deserve this place, I have fought to live here!” (3), and then acknowledging her confusion at Lucien’s presentation of the “Bill of sale” (4). The student’s consideration of Marie-Neige’s loneliness, and a desire to retreat into it, is <b>relevant</b>: “I just want to be left alone” (3). The student ends with Marie-Neige’s <b>straightforward and relevant</b> realizations about the effect adversity has had on her identity: “I am a strong woman and these hardships have only made me stronger” (4) and “Now that I have the farm, I feel as though I can do anything” (4), thereby verifying the <b>generalized exploration of the topic</b>.</p> <p>The student primarily uses paraphrased details from the prompting text to provide <b>adequate support</b> for Marie-Neige’s inner monologue. Such support is evident in “I would show them my lost child that I buried under the trees by the garden” (3), and “He laid out some papers for me to look at” (4), and “Searching for to give a compliment, he commented on the freshness of the well water” (4) <b>clarifies the student’s ideas and impressions</b>. The additional details about the “well” (3), wanting “Roman back” (3), and “the small stone” (4) also <b>clarify</b> the student’s impressions of Marie-Neige’s struggle to overcome her adversity.</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1 June 2011  
Personal Response to Texts Assignment**

**EXAMPLE PAPER—SATISFACTORY–2**

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p><b>Presentation (S)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The voice created by the student is apparent.</li> <li>• Stylistic choices are adequate and the student’s creation of tone is conventional.</li> <li>• The unifying effect is appropriately developed.</li> </ul> <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em; margin-top: 100px;">S</p>	<p>The student’s use of contemporary colloquialisms such as “and yet I am receiving the short end of the stick over and over and over again” (3), and “I am sick of fighting a seemingly never ending battle. I just want a break” (3), and “After being so low, there is nothing that can hold me down” (4) creates at best an <b>apparent voice</b> for a 19th century woman. The student creates an awkward hybrid voice for Marie-Neige comprised of the student’s personal voice and Ondaatje’s phraseology that results in a <b>conventional tone</b> and <b>adequate stylistic choices</b>. For example, “I am so sick of this! I am sick of fighting a seemingly never ending battle” (3) and “I just want a break” (3), in juxtaposition to “Suddenly I feel someone take my hand, I try to jerk it away” (3) and “Searching for to give a compliment, he commented on the freshness of the well water” (4).</p> <p>The <b>unifying effect is appropriately developed</b> by a mirroring of the events from the prompting text and also through the imagery of the well. The student opens the monologue with a reference to the “well” (3), evokes this image again as Marie-Neige slams her “fist against the stone edge” (3), and returns to it just before her final realization: “I thought of the small stone that slipped into the well” (4).</p>

English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011  
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Proficient–1 (Pf)

*Initial Planning*

To which of the provided texts are you responding? What is the connection between the text(s) and your response?

The picture. Both the man and I feel the same way. We see what is happening around us. but are unable to do anything about it (my parent's business going into debt)

What idea do you intend to explore and how does it address the topic?

Watching others fail or struggle with life's challenges will allow me to learn from their mistakes & also change my perspectives on things

State your choice of prose form. Choose from prose forms that you have practised in English Language Arts 30–1. You may respond using a personal, creative, or analytical perspective. Do NOT use a poetic form.

Personal essay



English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011  
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Proficient–1 (Pf)

*Planning*

- Watching my mother cry about my Dad's inability to confront people about business issues taught me to...
  - ~~take~~ be confrontational when needed
  - be realistic about future career
  - not marry a dreamer
- Seeing them in debt has turned me into
  - a determined person
  - they can't pay for me to do things so I do it myself
  - wanting a career that will make me money.

English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011  
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Proficient–1 (Pf)

Learning Through The Glass

My Dad told me that he knew he wanted to be a logbuilder since the age of 12. Today he is one of the best logbuilders in Alberta. His work is exceptional and he is continuously being praised for it. One might think that being so successful as a builder, the logbuilding company that him and my mother run would be just as successful. In fact, it's not. My family's business is in debt and it has caused immense stress on my parents. Looking at the photograph that was presented to me in my exam this morning, I feel a connection with the man who is trapped in a glass booth. Both him and I can see what is going on around us, yet we are not able to be a part of it. I have witnessed the tears and stress brought on by my parents failing business, but I know I cannot be part of the solution. Instead, I watch. I watch as they face adversity and struggle. From the outside looking in, I have learnt from their struggles and it has turned me into who I am today.

I have seen my mother cry many times. She cries about the debt that the business is in, but mostly she cries tears of frustration. I know she loves my father, but like everyone, my father has his flaws. He's a very humble, quiet and kind man. These are all good things, but when it comes to business, it's a major crack in the glass. He charges too low, and does too many favours for people, which results in his business not making enough money. It could be said that my father is also trapped in a glass booth. He's stuck in his ways and even though my mother tries to get him to raise his prices and quit doing so many favours, he seems unable to. There have been many instances where my father will not get paid for all the work he's done, and instead of confronting his clients, he lets it slide, hoping that eventually the person's goodheartedness will shine through and he'll

(Page 3 of 5)

English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011  
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Proficient–1 (Pf)

receive his money. Unfortunately that is rarely the case. Watching these decisions, i've come to see that people, although they may be nice, will try whatever they can to save money, even if it means hurting others. It's not only bad business decisions, but also personal flaws that have led to the decline of my parents business.

From my glass booth, I can clearly see the shattering of my parents business. Although I hate seeing my mother cry and my dad work endless hours, I have taken away knowledge that I might other wise never have learned. Observing my fathers inability to be confrontational and the havoc it has caused, I have gathered that in order to solve a problem, I must step outside of my sheltered booth, and immediately tackle it. I have learnt that although being kind to people is good, there is a time when it's ok to say no and to think about yourself instead. From my mother i've learnt that sitting down and crying, although it breaks my heart to see, is not going to lead anywhere. Instead, i've gathered that when faced with adversity, the best solution is to look for a solution and hold your head high.

Being on the outside of my parents struggles, unable to help, and witnessing how they live their life has helped me see what I want out of my life. We're not a poor family but I know that for myself, I want better. This desire to want a better life for when I have children has turned me into a determined girl who is willing to work hard to get there. I have chosen a career path that I know will allow me to make money and live the life that I want to when i'm older.

(Page 4 of 5)

English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011  
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Proficient–1 (Pf)

Many lessons that I have learned up to this point in my life, I have learnt not only from my own experience but also from the experiences of others. I have been held back by an invisible wall from my parent's business struggles. Locked into my youth and immaturity, I have only been able to view the adversity they face from a seperate window. The man in the photograph does not seem to be distressed about being locked in a glass booth, just as I don't mind being able to look at what is going on around me. Both of us are content to watch others from the outside, consoled in knowing that we are absorbing a world of knowledge. As we stare through the glass, and watch others battle adversity, we ourselves grow in knowledge and our identity is molded.

**English Language Arts 30–1 June 2011  
Personal Response to Texts Assignment**

**EXAMPLE PAPER—PROFICIENT–1**

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p><b>Ideas and Impressions (Pf)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The student’s exploration of the topic is purposeful.</li> <li>• Perceptions and/or ideas are thoughtful and considered.</li> <li>• Support is specific and strengthens the student’s ideas and impressions.</li> </ul> <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em; font-weight: bold;">Pf</p>	<p>On the Initial Planning page, the student identifies the basis for a controlling idea with “Watching others fail or struggle with life’s challenges will allow me to learn from their mistakes and also change my perspectives on things” (1). With a specific focus on her family, particularly in reference to the parents’ “logbuilding company” (3), the student’s <b>exploration of the topic is purposeful</b>. In the introduction, the student asserts, “I watch as they [the parents] face adversity and struggle. From the outside looking in, I have learnt from their struggles and it has turned me into who I am today” (3). The personal essay format often requires markers to suspend their expectations regarding thesis statements, and in this example, the student arrives at the full controlling idea in the concluding sentence where a direct connection is made between her life experiences and the man in the visual text: “As we stare through the glass, and watch others battle adversity, we ourselves grow in knowledge and our identity is molded” (5). This concluding <b>perception is thoughtful and considered</b>.</p> <p>The student’s sympathetic <b>perceptions</b> about her parents are <b>thoughtful and considered</b>: from the father, “I have learnt that although being kind to people is good, there is a time when it’s ok to say no and to think about yourself instead. From my mother i’ve learnt that sitting down and crying, although it breaks my heart to see, is not going to lead anywhere. Instead, i’ve gathered that when faced with adversity, the best solution is to look for a solution and hold your head high” (4). After observing the parents’ tribulations, the student arrives at the <b>thoughtful</b> understanding that “Being on the outside of my parents struggles, unable to help, and witnessing how they live their life has helped me see what I want out of my life” (4).</p> <p>The student explores the observation that the father is “stuck in his ways” (3) with <b>specific support</b> from life experiences: “even though my mother tries to get him to raise his prices and quit doing so many favours, he seems unable to” (3). The student cites a more detailed example “where my father will not get paid for all the work he’s done, and instead of confronting his clients, he lets it slide, hoping that eventually the person’s goodheartedness will shing through and he’ll receive his money” (3, 4). These details are <b>specific and strengthen the student’s ideas and impressions</b>.</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1 June 2011  
Personal Response to Texts Assignment**

**EXAMPLE PAPER—PROFICIENT–1**

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p><b>Presentation (Pf)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The voice created by the student is distinct.</li> <li>• Stylistic choices are specific and the student’s creation of tone is competent.</li> <li>• The unifying effect is capably developed.</li> </ul> <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em; font-weight: bold;">Pf</p>	<p>The student creates a <b>voice</b> that is <b>distinct</b>: “Observing my fathers inability to be confrontational and the havoc it has caused, I have gathered that in order to solve a problem, I must step outside of my sheltered booth, and immediately tackle it” (4) and “Locked into my youth and immaturity, I have only been able to view the adversity they face from a seperate window” (5). The <b>voice</b> is suitable for the context of a personal essay that utilizes various family anecdotes to explore ideas.</p> <p>The student makes <b>specific stylistic choices</b>, as in “Instead, I watch. I watch as they face adversity and struggle” (3) and “Watching these decisions, i’ve come to see that people, although they may be nice, will try whatever they can to save money, even if it means hurting others. It’s not only bad business decisions, but also personal flaws that have led to the decline of my parents business” (4). The student demonstrates a <b>competent tone</b> in the use of parallelism to describe the father as “a very humble, quiet and kind man.” (3) and in the use of complex syntactic structures such as “Being on the outside of my parents struggles, unable to help, and witnessing how they live their life has helped me see what I want out of my life” (4).</p> <p>The glass metaphor threaded throughout the student’s response creates a <b>capably developed unifying effect</b>. It is used to connect to the visual, to show the father’s entrapment in his ineffective ways, and to allow the student to observe her parents’ mistakes. At the end of the response, the student suggests that the glass booth has sheltered “this determined girl” (4) from suffering as the parents have, thereby allowing the student to absorb “a world of knowledge” (5) and learn from their experiences.</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011  
Personal Response to Texts Assignment**

**Example Scored Proficient–2 (Pf)**

***Initial Planning***

**To which of the provided texts are you responding? What is the connection between the text(s) and your response?**

---

---

---

---

**What idea do you intend to explore and how does it address the topic?**

---

---

---

---

**State your choice of prose form. Choose from prose forms that you have practised in English Language Arts 30–1. You may respond using a personal, creative, or analytical perspective. Do NOT use a poetic form.**

---

English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011  
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Proficient–2 (Pf)

Personal Response

It all felt unreal, though it was all happening right there before him. World War II, the final solution, the slaughter of millions of innocents, all in the name of one man's quest for glory. Heinrich Dachtzauwer was a mere private in the German army, recruited before Hitler's reign then forced to fight for a cause in which he didn't believe. He was on the front lines, surrounded by his comrades, his brothers-in-arms. They could hear the Allies approaching in their attempt to take Berlin, and Heinrich was suddenly very doubtful of the German's ability to defend it. He looked around at the soldiers around him, their filthy faces all wearing the same bleak expression, knowing these might be their last moments on this earth, fighting for a cause none of them thought was just. He caught sight of an old apartment building strikingly similar to the one in which he had grown up, and was suddenly transported back to the days of his youth in a powerful yet seemingly mundane memory.

He was standing on the balcony of his family's apartment, enjoying the morning air. Across from him, an older gentleman who had recently moved in was doing the same. They made eye contact and the old man smiled. It was the smile that really stuck in Heinrich's memory, the silent companionship between two complete strangers appreciating life. He felt as though he was behind a wall of glass, watching himself through a window with stillness and a heavy silence permeating the air. He hardly dared breathe for fear that this illusion would dissipate and he would be thrown back into the present world of violence and desolation. Abruptly, the image changed and Heinrich saw the old pond in the forest he used to visit as a child. This had been his peaceful place, a place he could escape to if life got overwhelming. He felt himself relax a little within the glass cage of his mind, but as he looked on in horror, the scene changed and soldiers



**English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011  
Personal Response to Texts Assignment**

**Example Scored Proficient–2 (Pf)**

were marching through, shouting and trampling all that was in their way. Heinrich heard the crack of a gunshot that shattered his glass cage and looked down at the blood stain slowly spreading across his uniform. Soldiers were streaming in from every corner and he knew they had lost Berlin, lost the war, but he didn't care.

"At last," he murmured, lying down and closing his eyes, "peace."

**English Language Arts 30–1 June 2011  
Personal Response to Texts Assignment**

**EXAMPLE PAPER—PROFICIENT–2**

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p><b>Ideas and Impressions (Pf)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The student’s exploration of the topic is purposeful.</li> <li>• Perceptions and/or ideas are thoughtful and considered.</li> <li>• Support is specific and strengthens the student’s ideas and impressions.</li> </ul> <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em; font-weight: bold;">Pf</p>	<p>The student <b>purposefully explores the topic</b> through a narrative describing the last moments of a German soldier in the Second World War. As he prepares to defend Berlin, the soldier, “recruited before Hitler’s reign then forced to fight for a cause in which he didn’t believe” (2), falls back into memories of his life before the war. These memories, first of the old man and then of the pond in the forest, thematically parallel “The Stricken Children” in that each involves the revisiting of old peaceful places that have been destroyed, in the poem by children, and in the story by war. The tone of nostalgia and peace evidenced by memories of “the silent companionship between two complete strangers appreciating life” (2) or the vision of the pond of his youth as “his peaceful place, a place he could escape to if life got overwhelming” (2) demonstrate what life was like for this German before war.</p> <p>The soothing images of Heinrich’s past are contrasted with the moment he is actually experiencing in a manner that is <b>specific and strengthens the student’s ideas and impressions</b>. Rather than a sense of peace, there is the resignation to impending defeat, with Heinrich “doubtful of the German’s ability to defend it” (2). The other soldiers are described in similarly defeated terms, with “their filthy faces all wearing the same bleak expression” (2).</p> <p>In the end, the narrator takes refuge in memory, his “glass cage” (2) as the enemy overruns his battlefield position. There is “a gunshot that shattered his glass cage” (3) and ends his life. Through death, the student suggests that the soldier finally finds “peace” (3) from war, rounding out the idea that the soldier’s life and identity have been destroyed by war much as the wishing well has been destroyed by those who clogged it with litter. This thematic parallel is <b>thoughtful and considered</b>.</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1 June 2011  
Personal Response to Texts Assignment**

**EXAMPLE PAPER—PROFICIENT–2**

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p><b>Presentation (Pf)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The voice created by the student is distinct.</li> <li>• Stylistic choices are specific and the student’s creation of tone is competent.</li> <li>• The unifying effect is capably developed.</li> </ul> <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em; margin-top: 100px;"><b>Pf</b></p>	<p>The student creates a narrative <b>voice</b> that is <b>distinct</b> and appropriate to the context of a short story set in the Second World War, avoiding vernacular expressions of the 21st century. The narrator describes Heinrich’s fellow soldiers as “his comrades, his brothers-in-arms” (2) hopeless men with “filthy faces” (2) and “bleak expressions” (2). <b>Stylistic choices</b>, as in “He hardly dared breathe for fear that this illusion would dissipate and he would be thrown back into the present world of violence and desolation” (2) as well as “He felt himself relax a little within the glass cage of his mind, but as he looked on in horror, the scene changed and soldiers were marching through, shouting and trampling all that was in their way” (2, 3) <b>are specific</b> and contribute to a <b>creation of tone</b> that is <b>competent</b>.</p> <p>The <b>unifying effect</b> begins with a soldier ready for battle but whose memory is spurred by seeing “an old apartment building strikingly similar to the one in which he had grown up” (2). The student’s establishment of what life was like before the war is achieved through this device and the subsequent flashback, which is ended by the attacking Allied soldiers and, ultimately, Heinrich’s death. This movement from a “bleak” (2) present to a “peaceful” (2) memory, then returning to the “desolation” (2) and death of the present, contributes to a <b>unifying effect</b> that is <b>capably developed</b>.</p>

English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011  
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Excellent–1 (E)

*Initial Planning*

To which of the provided texts are you responding? What is the connection between the text(s) and your response?

Divisadero - ~~overcoming~~ adversity = immigrant experience

What idea do you intend to explore and how does it address the topic?

1. Analysis of the text  
2. Personal experience - family coming to the U.S. + overcoming adversity.

State your choice of prose form. Choose from prose forms that you have practised in English Language Arts 30–1. You may respond using a personal, creative, or analytical perspective. Do NOT use a poetic form.

Personal/analytical

English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011  
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Excellent–1 (E)

*outline*

The role adversity plays in shaping an individual's identity

- The nature of adversity – character building?
- Overcoming adversity
  - Assuming responsibility for her own situation
  - Work – methodical, applies herself
  - With the help of Lucien – brink of the well (hopeless) -> excitement at the possibilities
- Development of identity
  - Working her own property
  - Self-sufficiency
  - Independence
  - Pride
  - "The grower of the black tulip" – symbolic of her pursuing her own success
- Personal connection
  - Experience immigrating? The immigrant's story?
    - Family – carving out a niche in Canada
    -

Discuss the ideas developed by the text creator in your chosen text about the role adversity plays in shaping an individual's identity.

Horses of the night – the response to adversity is disastrous.

Death of a Salesman – Willy Loman – refuses to believe in his own failure. Adversity pushes him to ignore it - desperation – reveals the uglier side of your character. Can't bring yourself to admit. He's pathetic at the end – living a "phony dream" Can't survive impediments to "a phony dream". Rather, he takes the weak way out – suicide.

A failure to respond to diversity is also defining in the character, setting them up for failure.

(Page 2 of 5)

English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011  
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Excellent–1 (E)

Part A: Personal Response

In the face of adversity, there is always one key moment – one that defines your character or breaks it. Emerging intact on the other side, you reflect on your experiences, and sometimes conclude that a life of adversity is sometimes infinitely more valuable than a life of privilege. In the process of surmounting obstacles, you discover a strength you never knew you possessed, an independence you never sought, and a joy you never knew you could feel. You look back on your life with pride.

The excerpt of Divisadero by Michael Ondaatje traces the development of Marie-Neige as she assumes responsibility on her farm and grows as an individual. With her husband Roman in prison and the duties on the farm thrust upon her, she undertakes this venture not by choice, but by necessity. Though she is uneducated, Marie-Neige is resourceful and dedicated, adapting to farmwork by learning from her own experiences and borrowing books to supplement her knowledge. The methodical approach to farming in the exposition highlights her ingenuity as prepares for planting by raking manure over plots and discouraging pests in the garden. Descriptions of her labour reveal her dedication to her work and determination to succeed, “[carrying a] bundle of shoots in her cupped hands as if it were a fallen bird to be returned to its nest.” The metaphor of “[renewing the earth] in an old battle zone” on her farm is appropriate in describing the catharsis of healing the scars left by the shock of abandonment. Lucien, who finds her “[staring] down into the well” in despondency, helps to lift the heavy burden of surviving alone on the farm and replaces it with “a sudden lightness” in Marie-Neige that is accompanied by anticipation of possibilities to come. With ownership of the farm comes ownership for her own destiny, empowering Marie-Neige to plan for the future and move beyond the brink of despair.

(Page 3 of 5)

English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011  
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Excellent–1 (E)

Working her land and earning her own livelihood gives Marie-Neige a sense of pride and newfound independence. In her recollections, remnants of bitterness in the wake of her husband's arrest are followed by happier memories, whereby she acquired the deed to her farm, independence from her husband and freedom from uncertainty in her future. As her character is shaped by her response to adversity, she moves beyond tragedy to self-sufficiency; though she continues to visit her husband in prison, she is no longer dependent on him for sustenance. Rather, she is invigorated by the "excitement about the farm's possibilities, now that she owned the land." Lucien notes that she is "entering the world of the grower of the black tulip," a symbol that she is now no longer surviving, but thriving and succeeding. Her identity becomes inextricably bound to the land and the triumphant success in her ordeal, having sacrificed happiness for the pride of clawing out her own niche.

These feelings of accomplishment can be said to be universal, for it is the process of surmounting obstacles, not the trial itself, that builds character. Ingenuity and the entrepreneurial spirit is a testament to the remarkable resilience of human beings in the face of adversity. Reflecting on my own privileged life, I must say that I have had neither challenge nor burden to overcome. Yet the story still resonates with me, because the raw emotions strike very close to stories I've heard, of countless immigrant families – mine included – struggling to make a place for themselves in Canada. I imagine these families to be like pioneers, exploring new frontiers and setting out bravely for an unknown country without any network of support upon which they can depend – just their own resourcefulness. They take a tremendous risk in the hopes of attaining a tremendous reward for their efforts. Overcoming linguistic and cultural barriers, I know that my parents' success can be attributed not to luck or chance, but to hard work and determination. As they move through the rhythms of everyday life in Edmonton, the quiet pride

(Page 4 of 5)

**English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011**  
**Personal Response to Texts Assignment**

**Example Scored Excellent–1 (E)**

in their accomplishments is evident in the work they do and the in satisfaction they derive from surviving yet another day. Like Marie-Neige, their identity too is tied to their success, which is all the more meaningful because they have earned it.



**English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011  
Personal Response to Texts Assignment**

**EXAMPLE PAPER—EXCELLENT–1**

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p><b>Ideas and Impressions (E)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The student’s exploration of the topic is insightful.</li> <li>• Perceptions and/or ideas are confident and discerning.</li> <li>• Support is precise and aptly reinforces the student’s ideas and impressions.</li> </ul>	<p>The student establishes an opening position whereby “a life of adversity is sometimes infinitely more valuable than a life of privilege” (3), and <b>confidently</b> asserts that “In the process of surmounting obstacles, you discover a strength you never knew you possessed, an independence you never sought, and a joy you never knew you could feel” (3).</p> <p>The student begins the <b>discerning</b> analysis of “the development of Marie-Neige as she assumes responsibility on her farm and grows as an individual” (3) by recognizing that Marie Neige “undertakes this venture not by choice, but by necessity” (3) and that she “is resourceful and dedicated” (3) in her “methodical approach to farming” (3). The student then provides a <b>confident</b> staging of details to move to an <b>insightful</b> interpretation of “the catharsis of healing the scars left by the shock of abandonment” (3). The student further alludes to Lucien’s role in helping “to lift the heavy burden of surviving alone on the farm” (3) which leads to the <b>discerning</b> idea that with Marie Neige’s “ownership of the farm comes ownership for her own destiny” (3). This idea serves as a transition to the discussion on how Marie Neige “moves beyond tragedy to self sufficiency” (4) and the <b>precise</b> use of the black tulip symbolism as support for the distinction “that she is now no longer surviving, but thriving and succeeding” (4).</p> <p>After presenting the analysis of Marie-Neige’s transformation of character, the student shifts to an <b>insightful</b> consideration of the universality of her experience that demonstrates how “it is the process of surmounting obstacles, not the trial itself, that builds character” (4). Although acknowledging a lack of personal adversity, the student utilizes the example of “countless immigrant families” (4) who are “like pioneers, exploring new frontiers and setting out bravely for an unknown country without any network of support” (4) to <b>aptly reinforce the student’s ideas and impressions</b>. Ultimately, the student arrives at the <b>confident and discerning</b> conclusion that “their identity too is tied to their success, which is all the more meaningful because they have earned it” (5).</p>

E

**English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011  
Personal Response to Texts Assignment**

**EXAMPLE PAPER—EXCELLENT–1**

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p><b>Presentation (E)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The voice created by the student is convincing.</li> <li>• Stylistic choices are precise and the student’s creation of tone is adept.</li> <li>• The unifying effect is skillfully developed.</li> </ul> <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em; font-weight: bold;">E</p>	<p>Throughout the response, the student’s controlled use of language creates a <b>convincing voice</b>. Although the student’s use of “you” may be considered somewhat atypical in an analytic response, the fact that it is only used in the introduction suggests that it is a purposeful stylistic choice employed as an opening strategy to engage the reader.</p> <p>Confident and complex structures, often including embedded quotations, are used effectively in the response, such as: “Lucien, who finds her ‘[staring] down into the well’ in despondency, helps to lift the heavy burden of surviving alone on the farm and replaces it with ‘a sudden lightness’ in Marie-Neige that is accompanied by anticipation of possibilities to come” (3). These structures convey the <b>convincing voice</b> that is maintained throughout the response. Furthermore, the student utilizes <b>precise</b> descriptive phrases and diction such as “empowering” (3), “remnants of bitterness” (4), and “inextricably bound” (4) to describe Marie Neige’s experience. The student’s personal revelation that “I must say I have had neither challenge nor burden to overcome” (4) demonstrates a confident voice and an <b>adept creation of tone</b> to signal a shift in analytic focus.</p> <p>As outlined in the student’s planning page, <b>the unifying effect is skillfully developed</b> through the student’s transition from detailed analysis to personal reflection. The analysis begins with establishing the framework of details outlining Marie-Neige’s adversity which, coupled with Lucien’s benevolence, leads to her “ownership over her own destiny” and “empowerment” (3). The resulting identity and “triumphant success in her ordeal” (4) provides a link to the student’s philosophical contemplation “of countless immigrant families” (4) and an acknowledgment of “the quiet pride in their accomplishments” (4, 5). The concluding sentence unites Marie-Neige and these immigrant families: “Like Marie-Neige, their identity too is tied to their success, which is all the more meaningful because they have earned it” (5).</p>

English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011  
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Excellent–2 (E)

*Initial Planning*

To which of the provided texts are you responding? What is the connection between the text(s) and your response?

The stricken children – people who go through personal adversity dream and wish for something better; they are not apathetic to life (ie. they care)

What idea do you intend to explore and how does it address the topic?

The adversity a person feels leads to that person becoming a stronger individual as long as they are willing to dream for something better.

State your choice of prose form. Choose from prose forms that you have practised in English Language Arts 30–1. You may respond using a personal, creative, or analytical perspective. Do NOT use a poetic form.

Creative

English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011  
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Excellent–2 (E)

Wandering

Leaving home was possibly the hardest thing I ever had to do. None of them really understood why I needed to go, but they smiled and supported me nonetheless. I didn't expect them to understand so I didn't explain, but part of me wished that they would have asked me why. I wished that we could've had a single conversation that didn't end in blank stares and awkward silences. I didn't expect them to open up, but I wished for it.

To say that my childhood was an unhappy one would not be untrue, but it wouldn't necessarily be true either. I lived in comfort and had what I needed and some of what I wanted, but I lived a sheltered life and the need for me to go out into the world was greater than my parents could comprehend. We were all extremely passive aggressive, never actually confronting any problems that arose in our lives. We just sat at the dinner table, in uncomfortable silence, my mother's lips pursed with doubt, my father's brow furrowed, and just let the problems wash over us until we all forgot about it. That was the only solution my parents ever taught me - forget. We never forgave, we just forgot. Yes, we loved each other, but the resentment we felt for each other grew and festered deep within us until we couldn't stand to be in the same room for more than an hour at a time.

I was shy and uncomfortable with my peers, who were ready to confront me about anything, and everything, that I said, and my adolescent years were no better. I had friends, but I was still on the sidelines. I was never the protagonist in my own life story. I was more like an adept observer, a narrator who knew all but never participated. I found my sanctuary during those years of awkward teen-aged angst, my little corner of the world that no-one else knew about. Of course, looking back, it seems obvious that other people knew of the little clearing that

English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011  
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Excellent–2 (E)

I considered my own, but my narcissistic and hormonally charged mind didn't notice. I spent a lot of time reading about places that I couldn't even begin to imagine, and places that I knew that one day I would travel to. I wanted to be like the fictional characters in my novels, living lives of adventure and journeying to places where I could make something of myself.

This was the place where I would wish for all the things that my mind could think of, but also one thing that it never stopped thinking about: leaving home. I wished not for the ability to leave, but for the courage to do so. When, finally, it was time to say goodbye, I saw my parents, not as the antagonists that I had made them out to be, but sad people who had no sense of what dreaming really was anymore. All the frustration and resentment melted away. I saw all the regret that they felt, seeing me venture off on my own, and I could do nothing but leave.

The world was still new to me, and everything I did know happened to be from fictional novels and characters that didn't exist in reality. I journeyed into mountains, cities, deserts, and oceans - anywhere that I could go, I went. The cynicism and awkwardness that defined my youth was still there, but I grew into it. I discovered that I wasn't perfect, which was something that, at first, I couldn't wrap my head around. I wandered the world that I didn't know and ended up back in the world that I thought I had understood. I visited home and discovered that it was different from what I remembered. It always seems that way; the place you leave seems to change drastically when you return when, in reality, not much has changed at all. Reunions happened and I found that people had changed, and that I was one of those people. I was still the observer, never the center of attention or truly involved in anything, but I was perfectly content. I didn't feel any aversion to saying what was on my mind anymore. The people I had considered to be my friends my whole life actually became my friends.

(Page 3 of 4)

English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011  
Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Example Scored Excellent–2 (E)

I visited my old sanctuary, but found that it was no longer the pristine clearing that it had once been. The memories I had conjured up a very different image from the murky, dirty clearing that I saw. As I stood there, a couple children walked through the clearing and threw away their garbage without any regard for who or what was there. I looked at the children as they walked, and saw children whose smiles didn't reach their eyes and I was reminded of my parents. These children were prematurely old; they had already dismissed their dreams as impossible. They were completely unaware of dreaming altogether. I mourned for them. Maybe one day, I could teach them what I learned. Maybe one day I could teach them to dream.

**English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011**  
**Personal Response to Literary Texts Assignment**  
**EXAMPLE PAPER—EXCELLENT–2**

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p><b>Ideas and Impressions (E)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The student’s exploration of the topic is insightful.</li> <li>• Perceptions and/or ideas are confident and discerning.</li> <li>• Support is precise and aptly reinforces the student’s ideas and impressions.</li> </ul>	<p>The student begins the narrative with a description of a necessary departure from an uncommunicative home, mirroring the narrator of “The Stricken Children”, forming the basis of an <b>insightful exploration of the topic</b>. The narrative discusses a bland childhood that included “what I needed and some of what I wanted” (2), yet adversely restricted the growth of the narrator who felt “the need for me to get out into the world [that] was greater than my parents could comprehend”(2). <b>Precise</b> evidence of the “passive aggressive” (2) nature of the familial relationship is developed in the description of the “uncomfortable silence” (2) at the dinner table where the family “just let the problems wash over us until we all forgot about it” (2), and in the <b>discerning perception</b> that although “we loved each other ... the resentment we felt for each other grew and festered” (2).</p> <p>Much of the student’s <b>insightful exploration of the topic</b> is achieved through the juxtaposition of the “years of awkward teen-aged angst” (2) with the result of “journeying to places where I could make something of myself” (3), <b>aptly reinforcing the ideas and impressions</b>. The narrator who was “shy and uncomfortable with my peers” (2) and lived life “on the sidelines” (2) does not change identity, <b>discerning</b> that “the cynicism and awkwardness that defined my youth was still there, but I grew into it” (3) and “I was still the observer . . . but I was perfectly content” (3). Revisiting the symbolic “sanctuary” (2), in earlier years the only place the narrator could escape life’s adversity and dream of “places that I couldn’t even being to imagine” (3), brings the narrator full circle. The children who “threw away their garbage without any regard for who or what was there” (4) and “whose smiles didn’t reach their eyes” (4) are a <b>precise and apt reinforcement</b> of the cultural sickness referenced in the poem. Recognizing in these children echoes of the narrator’s parents, the narrator realizes that adversity has made them dismiss “their dreams as impossible” (4) and vows that “Maybe one day, I could teach them what I learned. Maybe one day I could teach them to dream” (4).</p>

E

**English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011**  
**Personal Response to Literary Texts Assignment**  
**EXAMPLE PAPER—EXCELLENT–2**

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p><b>Presentation (E)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The voice created by the student is convincing.</li> <li>• Stylistic choices are precise and the student’s creation of tone is adept.</li> <li>• The unifying effect is skillfully developed.</li> </ul> <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em; margin-top: 100px;"><b>E</b></p>	<p>The student employs <b>precise</b> detail to create the <b>convincing voice</b> of a narrator who “was never the protagonist in my own life story” (2), evolving from “an adept observer” (2) easily confronted by peers “about anything, and everything” (2) to someone with a comfortable identity who “didn’t feel any aversion to saying what was on my mind anymore” (3), someone confident that “I could teach them what I learned” (4).</p> <p><b>Precise diction</b> creates the <b>adept</b>, almost understated, <b>tone</b> of a coming-of-age story, exemplified by such phrases as “my mother’s lips pursed with doubt, my father’s brow furrowed” (2), “my narcissistic and hormonally challenged mind” (3), and the description of the children who “were prematurely old” (4) for whom the narrator mourns.</p> <p><b>The unifying effect is skillfully developed</b>, moving from the description of an environment void of “a single conversation that didn’t end in blank stares and awkward silences” (2) to an escape into “The world [that] was still new to me” (3) where the narrator “discovered that I wasn’t perfect” (3), returning to the idea that “the place you leave seems to change drastically when you return when, in reality, not much has changed at all” (3), realizing that perception of self is what changed everything. The narrative ends with the narrator’s wish to bring that realization to the children in the no longer “pristine clearing” (4) who need to re-learn how to dream.</p>



## *Examples of Students' Writing with Teachers' Commentaries*

English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011

Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Example Scored Satisfactory (S)

### *Initial Planning*

You may use this space for your initial planning. This information assists markers in identifying the text you have chosen to support your ideas. The markers who read your composition will be very familiar with the literary text you have chosen.

Literary Text and  
Text Creator

a Doll's House by Hendrik Ibsen  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

*Note:* Write the title of your chosen literary text on the back cover of this examination booklet.

### *Personal Reflection on Choice of Literary Text*

**Suggested time: 10 to 15 minutes**

Briefly explore your reasons for selecting the literary text as support for your response. Markers will consider the information you provide here when considering the effectiveness of your supporting evidence.

~ "Squirrel"

- Nora shows development in personality when Torvald find out the loan of Krogstad and Nora and that she has to leave and find herself
- When Mrs Linde arrives and tells she married for money and later Krogstad tells her she wants to take care of him
- Dr Rank when he finds out he is going to die and his refused love of Nora

English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011  
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Example Scored Satisfactory (S)

**Self-Development**

Troubles do not only have an evil side. Hard times can help people to learn themselves and shape and structure their own identity. In the play A Doll's House, by Hendrik Ibsen, the play shows the growth in Nora's personality after the disaster she is going through. Mrs. Linde also structures her personality when she helps Nora and comes in contact with Krogstad. When Dr. Rank finds out he is going to die he becomes true about his feelings for Nora. Ibsen develops the idea that adversity plays a role in shaping individuals personality.

Ibsen shows during the play that Nora Helmer is shaping her identity after some troubles with her husband Torvald. In the beginning of the play Nora is characterized with all the little words Torvald calls her. He calls her "squirrel" and "little skylark". This shows that Nora is dependent of Torvald but she does not make a problem of it. In the end of the play Torvald finds out of the loan Nora made with Krogstad to bring the whole family to Italy, because of the health of Torvald. Still, Torvald put this catastrophe away and want to move on just as it was before and wants to let Nora dependent on him. Nora does not want it and leaves the house. Nora her personality changed with this disaster and she knows she is always treated like a doll and never could be her own in his house. She knows when she stays in the house she cannot find her real self and she has to go out of the house and into the real world. This hard time made her think about her relationship with Torvald and her children and she sees herself only as a decoration in Torvalds's perfect doll's house. Not only Nora shows a change in personality after adversity, but also Mrs. Linde shows changes.

(Page 2 of 4)

English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011  
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Example Scored Satisfactory (S)

When Mrs. Linde comes at the house of Torvald and Nora, she tells that her husband died three years ago and left her nothing. No money and no children. She had married Mr. Linde because he had money. Mrs. Linde made this decision because she could take care of her family. After her husband died and his company broke, she had to work. When she helps Nora she comes in contact with Krogstad and makes the decision to live with Krogstad and take care of him and his children. Even she first married for money and let Krogstad stand on the side line, now she know she truly loves him and want to take care of him and his children. She had hard times in her life when she had no money and had to work but it changed her personality and she knew she had to take care of her mother and family. After her mother died, Mrs. Linde only had to take care of herself and came to Nora to find a job. In the character of Mrs. Linde you see that her personality is shaped after trouble and you can also see this in Dr. Rank.

Dr. Rank is a friend of Torvald and Nora. He is every day at their house. They know Dr. Rank is sick. When Nora wants to ask Dr. Rank to help her with her own catastrophe, she begins to flirt with him. Dr. Rank answers her flirting and he tells Nora that he is in love with her. Nora stops flirting with him and does not want to tell him anything about the catastrophe. After Nora refused his love there is a change in Dr. Rank his identity. He tells Nora that Torvald cannot see him when he is close to death and that he will post a card with a cross on it. This is the sign he is going to die. The bad luck for Dr. Rank is not only his sickness but also the refused love of Nora so he stays home and gives up his life.

In the play A Doll's House, Ibsen develops the idea that difficulties help develop personality. Ibsen shows it in the character Nora. First she is dependent on Torvald and likes to be treated like a doll. In the end, her personality is changed with the hard times she had and leaves the house. Also you see some changes in the identity of Mrs. Linde after her husband died and left

(Page 3 of 4)

**English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011  
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

**Example Scored Satisfactory (S)**

nothing behind. She now knows she wants to live with Krogstad because he is her true love and does not want to marry again because of money. Dr. Rank his personality shapes after the hard time that Nora gives him, because she rejects his love. He gives up his life, because he is sending a card with the message he is going to die. Going through bad times help to shape peoples own identity.

English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011  
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

## EXAMPLE PAPER—SATISFACTORY

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p><b>Thought and Understanding (S)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Ideas are relevant and straightforward, demonstrating a generalized comprehension of the literary text(s) and the topic.</li> <li>Literary interpretations are general but plausible.</li> </ul> <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em; margin-top: 100px;">S</p>	<p>The student acknowledges the benefits of adversity in the play, opening with the statement that “Troubles do not only have an evil side. Hard times can help people to learn themselves” (2). The student then connects this to the <b>straightforward and relevant</b> idea that “adversity plays a role in shaping individuals personality” (2), and applies it to the characters Nora, Mrs. Linde, and Dr. Rank.</p> <p>The student’s directing use of the idea that there is a “change in personality after adversity” (2) is examined initially through Nora who “cannot find her real self as she has to go out of the house and into the real world” (2), and the subsequent recognition that “this hard time made her think about her relationship with Torvald and her children” (2) as well as her place in the household.</p> <p>Applying this idea to Mrs. Linde, the student establishes that “she had hard times in her life when she had no money and had to work but it changed her personality” (3). Through the references to antecedent action, the student establishes the effect adversity had on Mrs. Linde’s identity, when she was forced marry Mr. Linde “to take care of her mother and family” (3) and “leave Krogstad on the side line” (3).</p> <p>Lastly, the student considers Dr. Rank and the adversity he faces when he reveals his feelings to Nora: “After Nora refused his love there is a change in Dr. Rank his identity” (3). The closing observation that “difficulties help develop personality” (3) is a <b>general but plausible literary interpretation</b>.</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011**  
**Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

**EXAMPLE PAPER—SATISFACTORY**

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p><b>Supporting Evidence (S)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Support is general, adequate, and appropriately chosen to reinforce the student’s ideas in an acceptable way but occasionally may lack persuasiveness.</li> <li>A reasonable connection to the student’s ideas is suitably maintained.</li> </ul> <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em; margin-top: 100px;">S</p>	<p>The student’s thesis is <b>reinforced</b> through an <b>appropriately chosen</b> examination of the characters Nora, Mrs. Linde, and Dr. Rank. Despite the student’s reliance on paraphrase, an understanding of the events and characters of the play in relation to the topic is evident.</p> <p>The student includes <b>adequate</b> support for Nora: “He calls her ‘squirrel’ and ‘little skylark’” (2), and “to bring the whole family to Italy, because of the health of Torvald” (2). Additional general <b>support</b> includes “Torvald put this catastrophe away” (2), and “she is always treated like a doll” (2).</p> <p>Mrs. Linde is presented as a woman who “married Mr. Linde because he had money” (3), whose “husband died three years ago and left her nothing” (3), and whose mother died” (3) demonstrating <b>adequately</b> chosen support.</p> <p>Details such as the assertion that Dr. Rank “gives up his life” (4) because of “the refused love of Nora” (3) that are chosen to reinforce ideas related to Dr. Rank’s change in personality in response to his adversity may <b>lack persuasiveness</b>.</p> <p>Consistently throughout the student’s use of three characters to address the topic, <b>a reasonable connection to the student’s ideas is suitably maintained</b>.</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011**  
**Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

**EXAMPLE PAPER—SATISFACTORY**

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p><b>Form and Structure (S)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A straightforward arrangement of ideas and details provides direction for the discussion that is developed appropriately.</li> <li>• The unifying effect or controlling idea is presented and maintained generally; however, coherence may falter.</li> </ul> <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em; margin-top: 100px;"><b>S</b></p>	<p>On the Initial Planning page, the student outlines the ideas for each of the three body paragraphs, which is presented as a blueprint in the introduction. In each paragraph, the student establishes a pattern: a description of the adversity, a statement of change, and then a concluding statement, thereby providing <b>direction for the discussion that is developed appropriately</b>. This straightforward arrangement, evident particularly in the concluding sentences, mechanically links the body paragraphs and <b>generally maintains the controlling idea</b>: “Not only Nora shows a change in personality after adversity, but also Mrs. Linde shows changes” (2), and “In the character of Mrs. Linde you see that her personality is shaped after trouble and you can also see this in Dr. Rank” (3).</p> <p>The student’s consistent connection between identity and adversity is a strength in the paper that contributes to a <b>unifying effect or controlling idea that is presented and maintained generally</b>. However, <b>coherence may falter</b> because the development of character motivation within the supporting paragraphs is missing, as is evident in sentences such as: “This shows that Nora is dependent of Torvald but she does not make a problem of it” (2), and “Still, Torvald put this catastrophe away and want to move on” (2), and “When Nora wants to ask Dr. Rank to help her with her own catastrophe.</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011  
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

**EXAMPLE PAPER—SATISFACTORY**

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p><b>Matters of Choice (S)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Diction is adequate.</li> <li>• Syntactic structures are straightforward, but attempts at complex structures may be awkward.</li> <li>• Stylistic choices contribute to the creation of a conventional composition with an appropriate voice.</li> </ul> <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em; margin-top: 100px;">S</p>	<p>The student’s <b>diction is adequate</b>: “Nora is characterized with all the little words Torvald calls her” (2), and “she knew she had to take care of her mother and family” (3), and “he tells Torvald that Nora cannot see him” (3).</p> <p>The student’s response is typified by <b>straightforward syntactical structures</b>, such as “When Dr. Rank finds out he is going to die he becomes true about his feelings for Nora” (2). <b>Attempts at complex structures may be awkward</b>: “Dr. Rank his personality shapes after the hard time that Nora gives him” (4) and “The bad luck for Dr. Rank is not only his sickness but also the refused love of Nora so he stays home and gives up his life” (3).</p> <p>Overall, <b>stylistic choices contribute to the creation of a conventional composition with an appropriate voice</b>: “This hard time made her think about her relationship with Torvald and her children and she sees herself only as a decoration in Torvalds’s perfect doll’s house” (2), and “After her mother died, Mrs. Linde only had to take care of herself and came to Nora to find a job” (3), and “This is the sign he is going to die” (3).</p>



**English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011**  
**Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

**EXAMPLE PAPER—SATISFACTORY**

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p><b>Matters of Correctness (S)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• This writing demonstrates control of the basics of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics.</li> <li>• There may be occasional lapses in control and minor errors; however, the communication remains clear.</li> </ul> <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em; margin-top: 100px;"><b>S</b></p>	<p>When accessing Matters of Correctness, markers are reminded of the instruction in the grey box to <b>consider the proportion of error in terms of the complexity and length of the response</b> in the context of exam conditions.</p> <p>Given that frame of reference, the writing in this response <b>demonstrates control of the basics of correct sentence construction, grammar and mechanics</b>: “Mrs. Linde made this decision because she could take care of her family” (3), and “He tells Nora that Torvald cannot see him when he is close to death and that he will post a card with a cross on it” (3), and “In the play A Doll’s House, Ibsen develops the idea that difficulties help develop personality. Ibsen shows it in the character Nora. First she is dependent on Torvald and likes to be treated like a doll” (3).</p> <p>There are <b>occasional lapses in control</b> in the misuse of prepositions, such as “Torvald finds out of the loan” (2) and “When Mrs. Linde comes at the house of Torvald and Nora” (3). There also are additional lapses in subject-verb agreement, grammar, and mechanics: “now she know she truly loves him and want to take care of him” (3) and “Going through bad times help shape peoples own identity” (4). However, the <b>communication remains clear</b>.</p>

English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011  
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Example Scored Proficient (Pf)

*Initial Planning*

You may use this space for your initial planning. This information assists markers in identifying the text you have chosen to support your ideas. The markers who read your composition will be very familiar with the literary text you have chosen.

Literary Text and  
Text Creator

Death of a Salesman

- Arthur Miller

*Note:* Write the title of your chosen literary text on the back cover of this examination booklet.

***Personal Reflection on Choice of Literary Text***  
**Suggested time: 10 to 15 minutes**

Briefly explore your reasons for selecting the literary text as support for your response. Markers will consider the information you provide here when considering the effectiveness of your supporting evidence.

All individuals face adversity in their life at some point, however it is not the act of facing adversity that builds character or shapes an identity rather it is -the act of recognizing the adversity one has faced throughout their life and making efforts to change and adapt that truly shapes ones personal identity. There is nothing gained by simply over coming hardships, it is only by realizing and facing the source of these hardships that an individual will ever be able to move on. This is exactly what Biff goes through in *DoS*.

(Page 1 of 5)

English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011  
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Example Scored Proficient (Pf)

Critical Response

Adversity is a common thread that spans all of humanity no matter an individual's creed, colour or character. It is through adversity that an individual is able to see more deeply within themselves and therefore see their true morals and values. *Death of a Salesman*, the award winning play by Arthur Miller explores the effects of adversity on an individual's character and identity through the character of Biff Loman and his relationship with his father, Willy Loman. The play follows Biff struggles in accepting his own identity rather than that which is forced upon him. As the play progresses it becomes evident that when an individual comes to terms with the adversity in their life, that individual must abandon their current identity in order to shape a new identity that is better suited for hardships.

An individual's ability to face adversity is directly related to their personal sense of identity and the world view that is associated with that. If an individual is unable to see the adversity that they face due to a misconceived notion of reality, that individual will be less suited to face present or impending hardships. The beginning of *Death of a Salesman* illustrates this idea tremendously. As we are first introduced to Biff it is obvious that he is not living a life that is optimally suited for his needs. Biff is in no way happy with the course his life has taken and the current path that lies in front of him. He outwardly admits that he feels "lost" and does not know "what he wants." However rather than attempt to pursue what he knows is best for him, Biff instead tries to follow obliviously in his father's footsteps. Since Biff is so focussed on being "well-liked" rather than happy he is not recognizing the adversity that he is currently facing. He is unable to see that in ignoring the desires and identity he truly has, he is creating a

(Page 2 of 5)

English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011  
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Example Scored Proficient (Pf)

more difficult path for himself. This pursuit of the “wrong dream” is a direct product of the indoctrination that Willy used on Biff as a boy. It is because of this improper personal identity that Willy instilled upon Biff that he is no longer happy or satisfied. The inflated ego that Willy gave his sons by calling them “Adonises” and “Hercules” is exactly why they became so narcissistic and in turn led to their unhappiness. By following so blindly the ideas and teaching of his father Biff is not seeing the adversity that surrounds his life and instead is harbouring a false identity that will inevitably lead to a life ill-suited for further challenges.

Until an individual is able to accept that their current challenges are in direct correlation with their ignorance of adversity that individual will never be able to cultivate a new identity that is better suited for their life. This acknowledgment will in turn breed a new sense of personal self and in doing so will eradicate the old identity that was inevitably causing hardship. The ideas of forging this new identity are quite apparent as the play progresses. The first instance in which we see Biff truly begin to come to terms with the adversity he has faced and its cause is shortly after Biff steals Bill Oliver’s pen. While running down the stairs after stealing the fountain pen Biff catches a glimpse of the sky. This sight of nature and the outdoors acts as the catalyst that forms Biff’s new personal identity. By seeing the wide open air and the bright blue of the sky Biff realizes what he actually loves in this world. Biff sees that it is not the so called “American dream” of the business world but the blue collared work of the great outdoors that is his true calling. In this moment Biff comes to terms with the fact that he is simply a “dime a dozen” and that he is happy being so. By finally comprehending that the adversity he has faced, Biff is able to see that his current path is not one that will lead him to real happiness. In turn Biff makes the effort to abandon the identity his father forced upon him

(Page 3 of 5)

English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011  
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Example Scored Proficient (Pf)

and instead pursue one which is more suited to his needs and values. In finally abandoning his previous toxic personal identity Biff is actually removing that which has caused so much of the adversity in his life. Instead he is now able to do what he feels is right and move on with his life, rather than being stuck in an ignorant misconception of reality.

Once an individual has come to terms with the adversity they have faced, that individual is able to truly move on with their life by confronting those who planted the seed of their old identity and therefore the adversity they had to face. The final scene of the play in which Willy and Biff finally talk to each other about one another and the epiphany that Biff experienced illustrates these ideas quite evidently. During their conversation Biff finally expresses to Willy that they are both just a “dime a dozen” and are in no way “leader[s] of men.” This act of expressing the truth and facing Willy with it truly shows how Biff has forged a new personal identity that is not afraid to face adversity. In outwardly acknowledging that Willy was in fact the reason for Biff’s misconception of reality and the hardships that he has faced, Biff is proving that he is better suited to face adversity since he would never have had this conversation before because it would be too difficult. This final act of trying to help his father, along with the rest of his family, once and for all solidifies the new identity that Biff has. By facing those who are still trapped within their false reality he is attempting to lessen the hardships his family is and will have to face. Furthermore, after these last attempts at helping his family Biff makes the decision to move on with his life by pursuing his own desires that are now more evident because of his new identity. Biff decides that he must move out west in order to live the life he now craves as a working man that is not obsessed with being “well-liked.” In the final pages of the

(Page 4 of 5)

English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011  
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Example Scored Proficient (Pf)

play we, as the reader, see Biff walk off from his father's funeral, still able to see that truth in situation and willing to move on to a life that is better suited for his new personal identity.

In order to better face adversity and individual must construct a new identity by accepting the adversity they have faced in their lives and source of these difficulties, so that they are more able to live a life more suited for their core values and morals. Arthur Miller's *Death of a Salesman* illustrates this need for adapting identity and the recognition of ones adversities. Through the process of analysing Biff Loman, we the reader, are able to see that when an individual comes to terms with their ignorant view of adversity, that individual is able to grasp a new personal identity therefore be more able to accept hardships in the future.

**English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011  
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

**EXAMPLE PAPER—PROFICIENT**

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p><b>Thought and Understanding (Pf)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Ideas are thoughtful and considered, demonstrating a competent comprehension of the literary text(s) and the topic.</li> <li>Literary interpretations are revealing and sensible.</li> </ul> <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em; margin-top: 100px;">Pf</p>	<p>The student demonstrates the <b>thoughtful idea</b> that “It is through adversity that an individual is able to see more deeply within themselves and therefore see their true morals and values” (2) and goes on to suggest that “Biff struggles in accepting his own identity rather than that which is forced upon him” (2). Through the idea that the “individual must abandon their current identity in order to shape a new identity that is better suited for hardships” (2), the student demonstrates a <b>revealing and sensible literary interpretation</b> of Biff in <i>Death of a Salesman</i>.</p> <p>With <b>thoughtful</b> consideration, the student suggests that Biff’s adversity is “due to a misconceived notion of reality” (2); and as a result, Biff “will be less suited to face present or impending hardships” (2).</p> <p>Literary interpretations are <b>revealing and sensible</b> as the student continues to develop, through an examination of Biff’s character, the need for a personal “epiphany” (4), that an individual must accept and acknowledge “their ignorance” (3) to “breed a new sense of personal self and in doing so will eradicate the old identity that was inevitably causing hardship” (3), allowing individuals to “truly move on with their life” (4). These statements demonstrate a <b>competent comprehension of the literary text and topic</b>.</p> <p>The student concludes with the <b>considered</b> idea that “In order to better face adversity and individual must construct a new identity by accepting the adversity they have faced in their lives” (5), and then offers the <b>thoughtful</b> idea that an individual will be able to “live a life more suited for their core values and morals” (5).</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011  
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

**EXAMPLE PAPER—PROFICIENT**

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p><b>Supporting Evidence (Pf)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Support is specific and well chosen to reinforce the student’s ideas in a persuasive way.</li> <li>A sound connection to the student’s ideas is capably maintained.</li> </ul> <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em; margin-top: 100px;">Pf</p>	<p><b>A sound connection to the student’s ideas is capably maintained</b> through <b>specific</b> references to the text. The student maintains that Biff feels “lost” (2), thereby reinforcing the notion that he does not know “what he wants” (2). His misconceptions of the importance of being “well-liked” (2) and his “pursuit of the ‘wrong dream’” (3) leave him “less suited to face present or impending hardships” (2). The <b>specific</b> reference to “‘Adonises’ and ‘Hercules’” (3) further reinforces this idea.</p> <p>The incident involving the theft of Bill Oliver’s pen is <b>specific</b> and <b>well chosen</b> as “the catalyst that forms Biff’s new personal identity” (3). The student notes the detail that “By seeing the wide open air and the bright blue of the sky Biff realizes what he actually loves in this world” (3) which strengthens the identification of the epiphany in a <b>persuasive</b> manner. The student’s idea is further developed by the understanding that Biff abandons the “American dream” (3), realizing he is “simply a ‘dime a dozen’” (3).</p> <p><b>A sound connection to the student’s idea</b> that Biff goes on “to live a life more suited to [his] core values and morals” (5) <b>is capably maintained</b> when he confronts “those who planted the seed of their old identity” (4). The student suggests that Biff and his father “are in no way ‘leader[s] of men’” (4) and “that he must move out west in order to live the life he now craves as a working man that is not obsessed with being ‘well-liked’” (4). The statement “This final act of trying to help his father, along with the rest of his family, once and for all solidifies” (4) Biff’s new identity and his willingness “to move on to a life that is better suited for his new personal identity” (5) <b>reinforces the student’s ideas in a persuasive way</b>.</p>



**English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011  
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

**EXAMPLE PAPER—PROFICIENT**

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p><b>Form and Structure (Pf)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A purposeful arrangement of ideas and details contributes to a controlled discussion that is developed capably.</li> <li>• The unifying effect or controlling idea is coherently sustained and presented.</li> </ul> <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em; margin-top: 100px;">Pf</p>	<p>The student offers a <b>purposeful arrangement of ideas and details</b> by focusing on the character of Biff. <b>A controlled discussion is developed capably</b> as the student describes Biff’s progression from “not recognizing the adversity” (2) to the “acknowledgement” (3) of his hardships through to the forging of “a new personal identity that is not afraid to face adversity” (4).</p> <p><b>The unifying effect is coherently sustained and presented</b> as the student describes Biff’s “struggles in accepting his own identity” (2). This idea is <b>developed capably</b> in subsequent paragraphs as in “Biff is in no way happy with the course his life has taken” (2), moving to “we see Biff truly begin to come to terms with the adversity he has faced” (3), and then arriving at the understanding that “Biff makes the decision to move on with his life by pursuing his own desires” (4). The student concludes with an assertion that integrates the text into the topic through the analysis of Biff’s character: “Through the process of analysing Biff Loman, we the reader, are able to see that when an individual comes to terms with their ignorant view of adversity, that individual is able to grasp a new personal identity therefore be more able to accept hardships in the future” (5).</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011  
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

**EXAMPLE PAPER—PROFICIENT**

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p><b>Matters of Choice (Pf)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Diction is specific.</li> <li>• Syntactic structures are generally effective.</li> <li>• Stylistic choices contribute to the creation of a considered composition with a capable voice.</li> </ul> <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em; font-weight: bold;">Pf</p>	<p>The student chooses <b>specific diction</b> such as “abandoning his previous toxic personal identity” (4), and “ignorant misconception of reality” (4), and “forged a new personal identity” (4).</p> <p><b>Syntactic structures are generally effective</b> as in “He [Biff] outwardly admits that he feels ‘lost’ and does not know ‘what he wants’” (2) and “This acknowledgement will in turn breed a new sense of personal self and in doing so will eradicate the old identity that was inevitably causing hardship” (3).</p> <p><b>Stylistic choices contribute to the creation of a considered composition with a capable voice</b> as in “harbouring a false identity that will inevitably lead to a life ill-suited for further challenges” (3), and also in the student’s reference to Miller’s metaphor of planting “the seed of their old identity” (4). This implicit allusion to Willy’s garden is a <b>considered stylistic choice</b>.</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011  
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

**EXAMPLE PAPER—PROFICIENT**

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p><b>Matters of Correctness (Pf)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• This writing demonstrates competence in control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics.</li> <li>• Minor errors in complex language structures are understandable considering the circumstances.</li> </ul> <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em; font-weight: bold;">Pf</p>	<p>The student’s effective use of <b>complex language structures</b>, rather than the more common and simple subject-verb-object sentence structure, is <b>competent</b> as in “Until an individual is able to accept that their current challenges are in direct correlation with their ignorance of adversity that individual will never be able to cultivate a new identity that is better suited for their life” (3).</p> <p>Considering the proportion of error in terms of the complexity and length of the response, the student demonstrates <b>competence in control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics</b> as in “This final act of trying to help his father, along with the rest of his family, once and for all solidifies the new identity that Biff has” (4).</p> <p>Despite the recurring comma and pronoun-antecedent errors, <b>minor errors in complex language structures are understandable considering the circumstances.</b></p>

English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011  
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Example Scored Excellent (E)

*Initial Planning*

You may use this space for your initial planning. This information assists markers in identifying the text you have chosen to support your ideas. The markers who read your composition will be very familiar with the literary text you have chosen.

Literary Text and  
Text Creator

Tennessee Williams → *Streetcar Named  
Desire*

*Note:* Write the title of your chosen literary text on the back cover of this examination booklet.

***Personal Reflection on Choice of Literary Text***  
**Suggested time: 10 to 15 minutes**

Briefly explore your reasons for selecting the literary text as support for your response. Markers will consider the information you provide here when considering the effectiveness of your supporting evidence.

*Blanche's perspective is thought for lifetime and  
find herself, ultimately, unable to ~~escape~~  
escape freedom.*

*There is an individual who chooses to ~~escape~~ in order  
to ~~escape~~ ~~escape~~ may find the ~~escape~~ of their  
imaginary world ~~improving~~ their from*

Additional space is provided for *Personal Reflection on Choice of Literary Text* on the following page.

*ON THE NEXT PAGE.*

English Language Arts 30-1, June 2011  
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Example Scored Excellent (E)

Personal Reflection on Choice of Literary Text

Thesis: A <sup>sensitive</sup> individual, ~~many~~ when forced with adversity, may be forced to forsake their personal identity in an attempt to find solace in the imaginary world.

Points

ADVERSITY

① Adversity of the past:

- ✓ epic fornications of the youth.
- ✓ Alan Grey → deliberate cruelty is unforgivable.
- ✓ reputation as an impure woman.
- ✓ acts w/ one of her students → attempt to relive her youthful love w/ Allan.

HOW SHE REACTS

② Arrival at Elysian Fields: (refuge)

- ✓ assumes the Southern Belle affectation.
- ✓ tells the lies, but tells them b/c it is what people want to hear.
- ✓ relationship w/ Mitch.
- unable to cope w/ Stanley → rage: forces her to retreat even more.
- ✓ cleanse herself of her past → constant bathing.
- ✓ ~~is a~~

LOSS OF IDENTITY

③ Ultimate demise:

- ✓ final place of exile + entrapment
- ✓ can no longer survive in the harsh world of reality
- ✓ retreats completely into the depths of her fantasy world
  - ↳ fantasy w/ the doctor + her death.
- ✓ No longer recognizable as Blanche Dubois.

Example Scored Excellent (E)

Loss of Identity

Adversity can present itself according to a vast spectrum of severity, and can have drastically different effects depending on the sensitivity of an individual. When faced with adversity, some are inclined to adapt in order to overcome such obstacles, whereas others find themselves unable to do so, and, ultimately, suffer a loss of identity.

Tennessee Williams explores, in his modern drama, A Streetcar Named Desire, a female protagonist's reaction to the constraints of adversity. Blanche Dubois, a ruined Antebellum, suffers from the constant threats of a tarnished reputation, and a lack of financial security. Nonetheless, her resourcefulness is apparent as she employs her unique techniques in order to conquer such adversities. Tennessee Williams develops the idea that a sensitive individual, when faced with adversity, may be forced to forsake their personal identity in an attempt to find solace in the imaginary world.

Living on a plantation in Laurel Mississippi, Blanche Dubois considers herself a Southern Belle, despite the changing times and her Antebellum status. Her life at Belle Rêve does not fulfill the dreams that once encircled the fanciful plantation. Instead, Blanche Dubois finds herself assuming the responsibilities for the « epic fornications » of the South, left to incur all financial debts. She faces extreme financial adversity, as she is the sole proprietor to Belle Rêve, and must therefore assume all financial responsibility, despite having to simultaneously pay for the costly funerals of her relatives. At last, unable to reimburse her debts, Blanche succumbs to the loss of her cherished land. In addition, she faces the adversity presented by a lifelong guilt, instilled in her the moment

English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011  
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Example Scored Excellent (E)

she made a cruel remark regarding her late husband, Allan Grey's, recently discovered homosexuality. Throughout the piece, Blanche maintains that deliberate cruelty is unforgivable, and, therefore, is unable to forgive herself for her husband's ensuing suicide. Finally, Blanche Dubois is constrained by social adversity, as she struggles to overcome a tarnished reputation. Having become extremely saddened by the loss of Belle Rêve, she turned to alcohol as a solace for her financial woes. Her usage of alcohol presents her initial attempt at escaping the harsh reality of a world that inflicts such adversity. Additionally, she began frequenting a brothel, which immediately stamped her with the label of an impure woman. Unfortunately, she needed the attentions of men in order to protect her dwindling self-confidence. In an attempt to relive her youthful love with Alan Grey, Blanche has sexual relations with a seventeen year old student, which immediately results in her exile from Laurel. Nonetheless, it equally represents her desire to live in a fantasy world, in which she is still a young woman, free from her now prominent adversity. To overcome such adversity, she must become resourceful.

Wrought with societal, financial, and personal adversity, Blanche Dubois comes to the realization that she must alter her identity in order to find salvation. Arriving at Elysian Fields, at the home of her sister and brother-in-law, Stella and Stanley Kowalski, Blanche immediately assumes a Southern Belle affectation. Because of her treatment in Laurel, she comprehends that she cannot allow the secrets of past to be known. Throughout her stay at Laurel, despite attempts to outrun her adversity, Blanche is continually haunted by the Varsouviana melody that played the evening of Alan Grey's death. Additionally, it is evident through her constant bathing that she is trying to cleanse herself of her past. The

(Page 4 of 7)

English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011  
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Example Scored Excellent (E)

bathing symbolizes her incessant need to scrub herself clean of her « impurities », which is consistent with her façade of pure, virginal woman. Nevertheless, she finds her life in the Kowalski household far from the refuge that she had envisioned. Instead, she meets further adversity in the form of Stanley Kowalski, who has no patience for her imaginary world. Consequently, she learns of Stella's pregnancy, which further emphasizes the impracticality of her living with the couple; there is no place for Blanche in the Kowalski household. However, Blanche soon encounters Mitch, a close friend of Stanley's, who immediately becomes the next target for Blanche's salvation. The ensuing relationship provides Blanche with the promise of marriage, which would finally allow her some rest from the adversity that has plagued her since Alan's death. Nonetheless, their relationship is based on Blanche's feigned persona, which cannot endure the effects of time. As Mitch confronts Blanche regarding her honesty, she hopes that, in divulging all, she may salvage their relationship. Instead, Mitch refuses to marry what he deems an impure woman. Enraged, Blanche explains that her lies are told because she wants only to provide people with that they would like to hear. As her final hope for salvation crumbles, Blanche understands that she must never reveal the true identity of her past, and must, instead, maintain her façade, living solely from the happiness of her imaginary world.

Blanche Dubois suffers an eternal loss of identity, as she chooses the world of imagination and fantasy as her only refuge from the adversity that she finds herself unable to overcome. She suffers, at the hands of Stanley Kowalski, the most cruel of actions. He rapes Blanche, leaving her unable to ever reclaim the purity that she has been

(Page 5 of 7)



English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011  
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Example Scored Excellent (E)

attempting to salvage since her arrival at Elysian Fields. Her only solution to achieve this reclamation is through her complete retreat into her imagination, in which she can create a life free from adversity. However, her retreat leaves her unrecognizable to Stella, leaving only the empty shell of her sister, as Blanche has forsaken her identity. Facing adversity, Blanche succumbed, forcing her to live from the depths of her fantasy world. She can no longer survive in the harsh world of reality. Stella and Stanley decide that Blanche, as she cannot continue living in their home, must be committed to a mental asylum. Nonetheless, when Blanche is told that she will be leaving, she only further expands her imaginary world, informing Stella and Stanley that she has been invited by an old friend to join him on his yacht. She states that she will die from eating an unwashed grape, her hand in that of a young doctor, who will bury her in a pristine white bag and drop her overboard. The scene is idyllic, and the pristine bag represents her achievement of her desired purity. This final fantasy reveals Blanche's being able to conquer adversity only through her imagination, which results in a complete loss of identity. As she is sent to the asylum, she is, ultimately, being sent to her final place of exile and entrapment, having proven unable to adapt her identity in order to overcome adversity.

Blanche Dubois's sensitivity predisposes her to a fragility in the face of adversity, leaving her susceptible to a loss of identity. Having been faced with financial and personal adversity regarding the loss of Belle Rêve and her guilt regarding Alan Grey, Blanche turns to the use of alcohol as her initial attempt at removing herself from the reality of her situation. As Blanche's reputation quickly loses all validity, she has an

(Page 6 of 7)

English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011  
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment

Example Scored Excellent (E)

epiphane, urging her that, in order to not meet a fate as she had met in Laurel, she must create a façade. Additionally, she must provide people with what they want to hear, whether it be truthful or falsified. Nonetheless, her employment of a feigned persona limits her ability to maintain her own individual identity, becoming, instead, an image of what others desire and value. Adversity assumes a crucial role in Blanche's demise, leaving her incapable of surviving in the world of harsh reality, and stripping her entirely of her identity. Tennessee Williams depicts, in his modern drama, A Streetcar Named Desire, that, as a sensitive individual is faced with adversity, the world of imagination may prove to be a source of escape, but will, inevitably, cause the loss of personal identity.

**English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011  
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

**EXAMPLE PAPER—EXCELLENT**

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p><b>Thought and Understanding (E)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Ideas are insightful and carefully considered, demonstrating a comprehension of subtle distinctions in the literary text(s) and the topic.</li> <li>Literary interpretations are perceptive and illuminating.</li> </ul> <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 48pt; font-weight: bold;">E</p>	<p>The student begins by <b>demonstrating a comprehension of the subtle distinctions</b>, complexities, and ambiguities <b>of the literary text and topic</b>. In the introduction, the student identifies that adversity “can have drastically different effects depending on the sensitivity of an individual” (3) thus forcing one “to forsake their personal identity in an attempt to find solace in the imaginary world” (3). These ideas are connected to a <b>perceptive</b> analysis of Blanche Dubois, whose “sensitivity predisposes her to a fragility in the face of adversity, leaving her susceptible to a loss of identity” (6).</p> <p>The student recognizes the necessity to provide antecedent details, most of which are revealed late in the text, as a means to illuminate the protagonist’s initial characterization. The student outlines <b>carefully considered</b> ideas about the three distinct sources of adversity in Blanche’s life prior to the beginning of the play: “societal, financial, and personal” (4), further demonstrating <b>comprehension of subtle distinctions in the literary text and topic</b>.</p> <p><b>Perceptive and illuminating literary interpretations</b> such as, “In an attempt to relive her youthful love with Alan Grey, Blanche has sexual relations with a seventeen year old student, which immediately results in her exile from Laurel. Nonetheless, it equally represents her desire to live in a fantasy world, in which she is still a young woman, free from her now prominent adversity” (4) and “This final fantasy reveals Blanche’s being able to conquer adversity only through her imagination, which results in a complete loss of identity” (6) reinforce the student’s <b>subtle comprehension of the literary text</b> as it connects to <b>the topic</b>.</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011  
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

**EXAMPLE PAPER—EXCELLENT**

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p><b>Supporting Evidence (E)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Support is precise, and astutely chosen to reinforce the student’s ideas in a convincing way.</li> <li>A valid connection to the student’s ideas is efficiently maintained.</li> </ul> <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em; margin-top: 100px;"><b>E</b></p>	<p>The student’s selection of <b>support is precise, and astutely chosen to reinforce the student’s ideas in a convincing way</b>. For example: “Blanche Dubois finds herself assuming the responsibilities for the ‘epic fornications’ of the South, left to incur all financial debts” (3), and “Throughout the piece, Blanche maintains that deliberate cruelty is unforgivable, and, therefore, is unable to forgive herself for her husband’s ensuing suicide” (4), and Stanley “rapes Blanche, leaving her unable to ever reclaim the purity that she has been attempting to salvage since her arrival at Elysian Fields. Her only solution to achieve this reclamation is through her complete retreat into her imagination, in which she can create a life free from adversity” (5, 6).</p> <p><b>A valid connection to the student’s ideas is efficiently maintained</b> through the student’s ability to provide <b>precise</b> details to reinforce ideas regarding the sources of Blanche’s adversity. The student recognizes Blanche’s “extreme financial adversity, as she is the sole proprietor to Belle Reve, and must therefore assume all financial responsibility, despite having to simultaneously pay for the costly funerals of her relatives” (3). The student asserts that Blanche’s personal adversity “presented by a lifelong guilt, [was] instilled in her the moment she made a cruel remark regarding her late husband, Allan Grey’s, recently discovered homosexuality” (3, 4). The student reveals Blanche’s societal adversity in stating that “she began frequenting a brothel, which immediately stamped her with the label of an impure woman. Unfortunately, she needed the attentions of men in order to protect her dwindling self confidence” (4).</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011**  
**Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

**EXAMPLE PAPER—EXCELLENT**

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p><b>Form and Structure (E)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A judicious arrangement of ideas and details contributes to a fluent discussion that is developed skillfully.</li> <li>• The unifying effect or controlling idea is effectively sustained and integrated.</li> </ul> <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 48pt;"><b>E</b></p>	<p>The student clearly defines and establishes a <b>fluent and skillfully developed discussion</b>, initially establishing the various sources of adversity that force Blanche to leave Laurel and come “to the realization that she must alter her identity in order to find salvation” (4). Recognizing that Stanley Kowalski does not believe “her facade of pure, virginal woman” (5) and that he “has no patience for her imaginary world” (5), “Mitch, a close friend of Stanley’s ... becomes the next target for Blanche’s salvation” (5). As this relationship fails due to the exposure of “Blanche’s feigned persona” (5), she tragically realizes that she must live “solely from the happiness of her imaginary world” (5). This “retreat leaves her unrecognizable to Stella, leaving only the empty shell of her sister, as Blanche has forsaken her identity” (6). Conclusively, “As she is sent to the asylum, she is, ultimately, being sent to her final place of exile and entrapment, having proven unable to adapt her identity in order to overcome adversity” (6).</p> <p>As a result of this <b>judicious arrangement of ideas and details</b>, the student establishes an <b>effectively sustained and integrated controlling idea</b> that “as a sensitive individual is faced with adversity, the world of imagination may prove to be a source of escape, but will, inevitably, cause the loss of personal identity” (7).</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011**  
**Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

**EXAMPLE PAPER—EXCELLENT**

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p><b>Matters of Choice (E)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Diction is precise.</li> <li>• Syntactic structures are effective and sometimes polished.</li> <li>• Stylistic choices contribute to the creation of a skillful composition with a convincing voice.</li> </ul> <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em; font-weight: bold;">E</p>	<p>The student seems to misuse both “Antebellum” (3) and “brothel” (4), but this should not detract from recognizing the <b>precise diction</b> utilized throughout the response. The Dubois family history establishes Blanche’s “Southern Belle affectation” (4) as archetypal of the Antebellum southern family. Also, the Flamingo Hotel is clearly established as a business of ill-repute, in which management overlooks the inhabitants’ indiscretions, and Blanche had many intimacies with strangers. Williams’ ambiguous depiction of this setting may well be perceived as a brothel by a naive student.</p> <p>Both <b>precise diction</b> as well as <b>effective and sometimes polished syntactic structures</b> are demonstrated throughout the response, as is evident in: “Adversity can present itself according to a vast spectrum of severity, and can have drastically different effects depending on the sensitivity of an individual. When faced with adversity, some are inclined to adapt in order to overcome such obstacles, whereas others find themselves unable to do so, and, ultimately, suffer a loss of identity” (3), and “Her life at Belle Reve does not fulfill the dreams that once encircled the fanciful plantation” (3), and “As her final hope for salvation crumbles, Blanche understands that she must never reveal the true identity of her past, and must, instead, maintain her facade, living solely from the happiness of her imaginary world” (5).</p> <p><b>Stylistic choices contribute to the creation of a skillful composition with a convincing voice</b>, as evidenced by the student’s ability to draw the reader thoroughly into Blanche’s adversity with a compassionate sensitivity. For example, “Having become extremely saddened by the loss of Belle Reve, she turned to alcohol as a solace for her financial woes” (4) and “Throughout her stay at Laurel, despite attempts to outrun her adversity, Blanche is continually haunted by the Varsouviana melody that played the evening of Alan Grey’s death” (4).</p>

**English Language Arts 30–1, June 2011  
Critical/Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment**

**EXAMPLE PAPER—EXCELLENT**

SCORING CRITERIA	RATIONALE
<p><b>Matters of Correctness (E)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>This writing demonstrates confidence in control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics.</li> <li>The relative absence of error is impressive considering the complexity of the response and the circumstances.</li> </ul> <p style="text-align: center; font-size: 2em;"><b>E</b></p>	<p>The student <b>demonstrates confidence in control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar and mechanics</b>: “Arriving at Elysian Fields, at the home of her sister and brother-in-law, Stella and Stanley Kowalski, Blanche immediately assumes a Southern Belle affectation” (4), and “Blanche Dubois suffers an eternal loss of identity, as she chooses the world of imagination and fantasy as her only refuge from the adversity that she finds herself unable to overcome” (5) and “Nonetheless, her employment of a feigned persona limits her ability to maintain her own individual identity, becoming, instead, an image of what others desire and value” (7).</p> <p><b>The relative absence of error is impressive considering the complexity of the response and the circumstances.</b></p>

## Scoring Categories and Criteria

### Scoring Categories and Scoring Criteria for 2010–2011

#### Personal Response to Texts Assignment

Because students' responses to the *Personal Response to Texts Assignment* vary widely—from philosophical discussions to personal narratives to creative approaches—assessment of the *Personal Response to Texts Assignment* on the diploma examination will be in the context of Louise Rosenblatt's suggestion:

*...the evaluation of the answers would be in terms of the amount of evidence that the youngster has actually read something and thought about it, not a question of whether, necessarily, he has thought about it the way an adult would, or given an adult's "correct" answer.*

Rosenblatt, Louise. "The Reader's Contribution in the Literary Experience: Interview with Louise Rosenblatt." By Lionel Wilson. *English Quarterly* 14, no.1 (Spring, 1981): 3–12.

Markers will also consider Grant P. Wiggins' suggestion that we should assess students' writing "with the tact of Socrates: tact to respect the student's ideas enough to enter them fully—even more fully than the thinker sometimes—and thus, the tact to accept apt but unanticipatable or unique responses."

Wiggins, Grant P. *Assessing Student Performance: Exploring the Purpose and Limits of Testing*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publishers, 1993, p. 40.

#### Ideas and Impressions (10% of total examination mark)

Cross-Reference to the *Program of Studies for Senior High School English Language Arts* 2.1 2.2 2.3 4.1

When marking **Ideas and Impressions**, the marker should consider the quality of

- the student's **exploration** of the topic
- the student's **ideas** and **reflection**
- **support** in relation to the student's ideas and impressions

#### Excellent

**E**

The student's exploration of the topic is insightful. Perceptions and/or ideas are confident and discerning. Support is precise and aptly reinforces the student's ideas and impressions.

#### Proficient

**Pf**

The student's exploration of the topic is purposeful. Perceptions and/or ideas are thoughtful and considered. Support is specific and strengthens the student's ideas and impressions.

#### Satisfactory

**S**

The student's exploration of the topic is generalized. Perceptions and/or ideas are straightforward and relevant. Support is adequate and clarifies the student's ideas and impressions.

#### Limited

**L**

The student's exploration of the topic is vague. Perceptions and/or ideas are superficial and/or ambiguous. Support is imprecise and/or ineffectively related to the student's ideas and impressions.

#### Poor

**P**

The student's exploration of the topic is minimal. Perceptions and/or ideas are underdeveloped and/or irrelevant. Support is lacking and/or unrelated to the student's ideas and impressions.

#### Insufficient

**INS**

**Insufficient is a special category. It is not an indicator of quality.** Assign Insufficient when

- the student has responded using a form other than prose **OR**
- the student has written so little that it is not possible to assess Ideas and Impressions **OR**
- there is no evidence that the topic presented in the assignment has been addressed **OR**
- there is no connection between the text(s) provided in the assignment and the student's response



**Scoring Categories and  
Scoring Criteria for  
2010–2011  
Personal Response  
to Texts Assignment  
(continued)**

**Presentation** (10% of total examination mark)

Cross-Reference to the *Program of Studies for*

*Senior High School English Language Arts* 3.1 3.2 4.1 4.2

When marking **Presentation**, the marker should consider the effectiveness of

- **voice** in relation to the context created by the student in the chosen prose form
- **stylistic choices** (including quality of language and expression) and the student's creation of **tone**
- the student's development of a **unifying effect**

**Consider the proportion of error in terms of the complexity and length of the response.**

**Excellent**

**E**

The voice created by the student is convincing. Stylistic choices are precise and the student's creation of tone is adept. The unifying effect is skillfully developed.

**Proficient**

**Pf**

The voice created by the student is distinct. Stylistic choices are specific and the student's creation of tone is competent. The unifying effect is capably developed.

**Satisfactory**

**S**

The voice created by the student is apparent. Stylistic choices are adequate and the student's creation of tone is conventional. The unifying effect is appropriately developed.

**Limited**

**L**

The voice created by the student is indistinct. Stylistic choices are imprecise and the student's creation of tone is inconsistent. The unifying effect is inadequately developed.

**Poor**

**P**

The voice created by the student is obscure. Stylistic choices impede communication and the student's creation of tone is ineffective. A unifying effect is absent.

**Scoring Categories and Scoring Criteria for 2010–2011 Critical / Analytical Response to Texts Assignment**

Because students' responses to the *Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment* vary widely—from philosophical discussions to personal narratives to creative approaches—assessment of the *Critical / Analytical Response to Literary Texts Assignment* on the diploma examination will be in the context of Louise Rosenblatt's suggestion:

*...the evaluation of the answers would be in terms of the amount of evidence that the youngster has actually read something and thought about it, not a question of whether, necessarily, he has thought about it the way an adult would, or given an adult's "correct" answer.*

Rosenblatt, Louise. "The Reader's Contribution in the Literary Experience: Interview with Louise Rosenblatt." By Lionel Wilson. *English Quarterly* 14, no.1 (Spring, 1981): 3–12.

Markers will also consider Grant P. Wiggins' suggestion that we should assess students' writing "with the tact of Socrates: tact to respect the student's ideas enough to enter them fully—even more fully than the thinker sometimes—and thus, the tact to accept apt but unanticipatable or unique responses."

Wiggins, Grant P. *Assessing Student Performance: Exploring the Purpose and Limits of Testing*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publishers, 1993, p. 40.

**Thought and Understanding** (7.5% of total examination mark)

Cross-Reference to the *Program of Studies for*

*Senior High School English Language Arts* 2.1 2.2 4.1 4.2

When marking **Thought and Understanding**, the marker should consider

- how effectively the student's **ideas** relate to the assignment
- the quality of the **literary interpretations and understanding**

**Excellent**

**E**

Ideas are insightful and carefully considered, demonstrating a comprehension of subtle distinctions in the literary text(s) and the topic. Literary interpretations are perceptive and illuminating.

**Proficient**

**Pf**

Ideas are thoughtful and considered, demonstrating a competent comprehension of the literary text(s) and the topic. Literary interpretations are revealing and sensible.

**Satisfactory**

**S**

Ideas are relevant and straightforward, demonstrating a generalized comprehension of the literary text(s) and the topic. Literary interpretations are general but plausible.

**Limited**

**L**

Ideas are superficial or oversimplified, demonstrating a weak comprehension of the literary text(s) and the topic. Literary interpretations are incomplete and/or literal.

**Poor**

**P**

Ideas are largely absent or irrelevant, and/or do not develop the topic. Little comprehension of the literary text(s) is demonstrated.

**Insufficient**

**INS**

**Insufficient is a special category. It is not an indicator of quality.** Assign Insufficient when

- the student has written so little that it is not possible to assess Thought and Understanding and/or Supporting Evidence **OR**
- no reference has been made to literature studied **OR**
- the only literary reference present is to the text(s) provided in the first assignment **OR**
- there is no evidence of an attempt to fulfill the task presented in the assignment

**Scoring Categories and  
Scoring Criteria for  
2010–2011  
Critical / Analytical  
Response to  
Texts Assignment  
(continued)**

**Supporting Evidence** (7.5% of total examination mark)

Cross-Reference to the *Program of Studies for*

*Senior High School English Language Arts* 2.3 3.2 4.1 4.2

When marking **Supporting Evidence**, the marker should consider

- the **selection** and **quality** of evidence
- how well the supporting evidence is **employed, developed, and synthesized** to support the student's ideas

**Consider ideas presented in the *Personal Reflection on Choice of Literary Text(s)*.**

**Excellent**

**E**

Support is precise and astutely chosen to reinforce the student's ideas in a convincing way. A valid connection to the student's ideas is efficiently maintained.

**Proficient**

**Pf**

Support is specific and well chosen to reinforce the student's ideas in a persuasive way. A sound connection to the student's ideas is capably maintained.

**Satisfactory**

**S**

Support is general, adequate, and appropriately chosen to reinforce the student's ideas in an acceptable way but occasionally may lack persuasiveness. A reasonable connection to the student's ideas is suitably maintained.

**Limited**

**L**

Support is inadequate, inaccurate, largely a restatement of what was read, and/or inappropriately chosen to reinforce the student's ideas and thus lacks persuasiveness. A weak connection to the student's ideas is maintained.

**Poor**

**P**

Support is irrelevant, overgeneralized, lacks validity, and/or is absent. Little or no connection to the student's ideas is evident.

**Scoring Categories and  
Scoring Criteria for  
2010–2011  
Critical / Analytical  
Response to  
Texts Assignment  
(continued)**

**Form and Structure** (5% of total examination mark)

Cross-Reference to the *Program of Studies for*

*Senior High School English Language Arts* 2.2 3.1 4.1 4.2

When marking **Form and Structure**, the marker should consider how effectively the student's organizational choices result in

- a **coherent, focused, and shaped** arrangement and discussion in response to the assignment
- a **unifying effect** or a **controlling idea** that is developed and maintained

**Excellent**

**E**

A judicious arrangement of ideas and details contributes to a fluent discussion that is developed skillfully. The unifying effect or controlling idea is effectively sustained and integrated.

**Proficient**

**Pf**

A purposeful arrangement of ideas and details contributes to a controlled discussion that is developed capably. The unifying effect or controlling idea is coherently sustained and presented.

**Satisfactory**

**S**

A straightforward arrangement of ideas and details provides direction for the discussion that is developed appropriately. The unifying effect or controlling idea is presented and maintained generally; however, coherence may falter.

**Limited**

**L**

A discernible but ineffectual arrangement of ideas and details provides some direction for the discussion that is underdeveloped. A unifying effect or controlling idea is inconsistently maintained.

**Poor**

**P**

A haphazard arrangement of ideas and details provides little or no direction for the discussion, and development is lacking or obscure. A unifying effect or controlling idea is absent.

**Scoring Categories and  
Scoring Criteria for  
2010–2011  
Critical / Analytical  
Response to  
Texts Assignment  
(continued)**

**Matters of Choice** (5% of total examination mark)

Cross-Reference to the *Program of Studies for  
Senior High School English Language Arts* 4.2

When marking **Matters of Choice**, the marker should consider how effectively the student's choices enhance communication. The marker should consider

- **diction**
- choices of **syntactic structures** (such as parallelism, balance, inversion)
- the extent to which **stylistic choices** contribute to the creation of **voice**

**Excellent**

**E**

Diction is precise. Syntactic structures are effective and sometimes polished. Stylistic choices contribute to the creation of a skillful composition with a convincing voice.

**Proficient**

**Pf**

Diction is specific. Syntactic structures are generally effective. Stylistic choices contribute to the creation of a considered composition with a capable voice

**Satisfactory**

**S**

Diction is adequate. Syntactic structures are straightforward, but attempts at complex structures may be awkward. Stylistic choices contribute to the creation of a conventional composition with an appropriate voice.

**Limited**

**L**

Diction is imprecise and/or inappropriate. Syntactic structures are frequently awkward or ambiguous. Inadequate language choices contribute to the creation of a vague composition with an undiscerning voice.

**Poor**

**P**

Diction is overgeneralized and/or inaccurate. Syntactic structures are uncontrolled or unintelligible. A lack of language choices contributes to the creation of a confused composition with an ineffective voice.

**Scoring Categories and  
Scoring Criteria for  
2010–2011  
Critical / Analytical  
Response to  
Texts Assignment  
(continued)**

**Matters of Correctness** (5% of total examination mark)

Cross-Reference to the *Program of Studies for  
Senior High School English Language Arts* 4.2

When marking **Matters of Correctness**, the marker should consider the correctness of

- **sentence construction** (completeness, consistency, subordination, coordination, predication)
- **usage** (accurate use of words according to convention and meaning)
- **grammar** (subject-verb/pronoun-antecedent agreement, pronoun reference, consistency of tense)
- **mechanics** (punctuation, spelling, capitalization)

**Consider the proportion of error in terms of the complexity and length of the response.**

**Excellent**

**E**

This writing demonstrates confidence in control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics. The relative absence of error is impressive considering the complexity of the response and the circumstances.

**Proficient**

**Pf**

This writing demonstrates competence in control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics. Minor errors in complex language structures are understandable considering the circumstances.

**Satisfactory**

**S**

This writing demonstrates control of the basics of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics. There may be occasional lapses in control and minor errors; however, the communication remains clear.

**Limited**

**L**

This writing demonstrates faltering control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics. The range of errors blurs the clarity of communication.

**Poor**

**P**

This writing demonstrates lack of control of correct sentence construction, usage, grammar, and mechanics. Jarring errors impair communication.



